

CREATIVE ARTS IN GROUP SUPERVISION OF COUNSELORS-IN-TRAINING

A Dissertation

by

LAUREN SHOWS POWER

BS, Texas A&M University-Corpus Christi, 2008
MS, Texas A&M University-Corpus Christi, 2010

Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

in

COUNSELOR EDUCATION

Texas A&M University-Corpus Christi
Corpus Christi, Texas

August 2013

© Lauren Shows Power

All rights reserved

August 2013

CREATIVE ARTS IN GROUP SUPERVISION OF COUNSELORS-IN-TRAINING

A Dissertation

by

LAUREN SHOWS POWER

This dissertation meets the standards for scope and quality of
Texas A&M University-Corpus Christi and is hereby approved

Marvarene Oliver, EdD
Chair

Karen Michelle Hunnicutt Hollenbaugh, PhD
Committee Member

Richard J. Ricard, PhD
Committee Member

Carey Rote, PhD
Graduate Faculty Representative

JoAnn Canales, PhD
Dean of Graduate Studies

August 2013

ABSTRACT

The purpose of the current study was to examine the use of creative arts in group supervision and its perceived effects on case conceptualization and counselor development from the counselor-in-training's perspective. Research questions guiding this study included: How do counselors-in-training (CITs) perceive the experience of participating in group supervision utilizing creative arts methods? How do CITs perceive the impact of group supervision that utilizes creative arts methods? How do CITs perceive the impact of group supervision utilizing creative arts methods on case conceptualization with current clients? How do CITs perceive the impact of group supervision utilizing creative arts methods on their development as counselors?

Participants included five Master's level CITs completing internships at a Counseling and Training Clinic (CTC) on the campus of a university in the southwestern region of the United States. These CITs were gaining clinical experience, as a part of the requirement, in counseling and were providing services to clients with various concerns.

Eight themes emerged: (1) positive experience, (2) balance with traditional supervision, (3) creating an environment, (4) engaging in a creative process, (5) perceptions of impact, (6) awareness, (7) importance of the group, and (8) techniques. The first theme, positive experience, includes a sub-theme, relaxation. The sixth theme, awareness, encapsulates both awareness of themselves and awareness of clients. The theme entitled *engaging in a creative process* includes authentic self and being present as subthemes.

Implication for practice and recommendations for future research are provided. Creative arts can be used in group supervision to help CITs get past rigidity, pressure to be right, and insecurity about being themselves. Further investigation of the internal creative process

experienced and the sense of safety expressed by counselors-in-training using creative arts in group supervision is needed to further support and expand these findings.

DEDICATION

To the counselors and supervisors who are willing to take their work outside of the box. May this dissertation serve as an encouragement to be creative and find new ways to look at the world, especially those that get your hands dirty.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

Completion of this dissertation would not have been possible without the support and encouragement of my family, friends, and dissertation committee. A heartfelt thank you to my dissertation chair, Dr. Marvarene Oliver, who allowed me to study something so personal to me and believing in my ability and place in this profession. Her wisdom and encouragement has helped me become the clinician, supervisor, researcher, and woman I am today. I also want to thank Dr. Richard Ricard, Dr. Michelle Hollenbaugh, and Dr. Carey Rote for their encouragement and enthusiasm in helping me along this journey.

I would like to thank my participants, for their contribution to this work. I will forever be grateful for their insight, openness, and willingness to join me in this exploration.

Thank you to my dear sweet friends, Fredericka DeLee, Sneha Nayar Bhalerao, Amanda Saddler, Rachel Holman and Stephen Lenz, as well as so many others who provided words of encouragement and emotional support along the way. Especially Fredericka for getting her hands dirty and helping through this massive undertaking associated with qualitative research.

A special thank you to my family: My mom and dad for their unfailing belief in me, Natalie and Andrew for their love and encouragement; Kathryn Power and my entire Power family for their words of encouragement. Thank you to my grandparents for always letting me know how proud they were of me, so often this is what kept me going. Finally, thank you to my husband and best friend Nicholas, for his patience, encouragement, and support. Now let's move to the next item on our list.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CONTENTS	PAGE
ABSTRACT	v
DEDICATION.....	vii
ACKNOWLEDGMENT	viii
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION.....	1
Background of the Study	1
Statement of the Problem	3
Purpose of the Study	3
Research Questions	3
Significance of the Study.....	4
Population and Sample	5
Instrumentation and Creative Arts Activities	5
Activity 1: Introductions through Personal Roadmap or Timeline	6
Activity 2: Exploring Concepts through Photographs and Images	7
Activity 3: Rosebush Fantasy Technique	7
Activity 4: Creature Creation.....	7
Activity 5: Sand Tray	8
Activity 6: Painting an Emotion.....	8
Activity 7: Music to Relate	8
Activity 8: Constructing a Concern through Clay.....	9
Activity 9: Found Poems	9

Activity 10: Collage to Explore Concepts	9
Data Analysis	10
Basic Assumptions	10
Researcher Bias	11
Limitations of the Study	11
Definitions of Key Terms	12
Summary	13
CHAPTER 2: LITURATURE REVIEW	14
Clinical Supervision	14
Group Supervision	17
Creative Arts	19
Creative Art in Therapy	21
Creativity in Counseling	22
Family Therapy	23
Play Therapy	23
Creative Approaches in Counselor Supervision	25
Student Counselor Development	30
Considerations for Art in a Research Study	34
Summary	36
CHAPTER 3: RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY	37
Research Questions	37
Rational for Qualitative Methodology	37

Phenomenology with Grounded Theory Methods	38
Role of the Researcher	39
Personal Experience	39
Professional Experience.....	40
Study Participants.....	41
Setting.....	42
Group Supervision Process	42
Data Collection	43
Participant Journals	44
Photographs.....	44
Observations and Field Notes	45
Individual Interviews	45
Focus Group.....	46
Data Transcription Methods	46
Member Checks	47
Data Analysis	47
Initial Coding	48
Focused Coding.....	48
Data Organization	49
Trustworthiness	50
Prolonged and Persistent Engagement	50
Triangulation.....	51

Debriefing and Peer Review	51
CHAPTER 4: RESULTS	52
Positive Experience	52
Relaxation	54
Balance with Traditional Supervision	54
Creating an Environment	55
Engaging in a Creative Process	57
Authentic Self	58
Being Present	60
Perceptions of Impact	61
Awareness	63
Self-awareness	63
Client Awareness	65
Importance of the Group	66
Techniques	69
CHAPTER 5: DISCUSSION	71
Overview of Findings	71
Relationship to Existing Literature	75
Positive Experience	75
Balance with Traditional Supervision	76
Creating an Environment	77
Engaging in a Creative Process	77

Perceptions of Impact	78
Awareness	79
Importance of the Group.....	80
Techniques	81
Researcher Final Thoughts about Emerging Data	81
Engaging in a Creative Process.....	83
Limitations of the Study	84
Implications for Practice.....	85
Recommendations for Future Research	86
Summary and Conclusion.....	87
REFERENCES	89
APPENDIX A: IRB APPROVAL LETTER.....	98
APPENDIX B: CONSENT FORM	100
APPENDIX C: IRB AMENDMENT APPROVAL FOR PEER REVIEWER.....	103
APPENDIX D: DEMOGRPAHIC FORM.....	106
APPENDIX E: JOURNAL PROMPTS	108
APPENDIX F: CREATIVE ARTS ACTIVITIES	110
APPENDIX G: INDIVIDUAL INTERVIEW QUESTIONS	122
APPENDIX H: IRB AMENDMENT APPROVAL 2	124
APPENDIX I: AMENDED CONSENT FORM	127

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION

Creative arts, when used in clinical situations, help counselors and clients “gain unique and universal perspectives on problems and possibilities” (Gladding, 1998, p. ix). Creative practices in counselor training foster connectedness and allow supervisees to experience the benefits and risks of intimacy associated with creative arts in therapy (Carson & Becker, 2004). Various creative practices are used in counseling and supervision; however, there has been limited study of the perceptions of counselors-in-training (CITs) who participate in creative arts supervision and the impact creative arts group supervision has on a counselor’s development. For purposes of this study, creative arts is defined as an activity that brings into being important ideas or feelings. I will examine the ways CITs perceive the use of creative arts in group supervision and its perceived effects on their development as counselors.

Background of the Study

Counseling, at best, is creative in nature (Gladding, 2011; Rogers, 1993). Throughout the history and development of counseling, pioneers in the field have searched the inner workings of themselves and the social systems around them to understand how to help clients heal. As a society, we understand that there is only so much self-expression possible using just verbal language. The messages that can be conveyed through language are telling; however, a song, picture, or dance can open the senses beyond what is possible by words alone. The business of counselors is to understand humans, usually clients, beyond what can be verbalized. Primarily, counselor supervision seeks to foster a greater sense of self-awareness among CITs (Bernard & Goodyear, 2009; Borders, 1990; Bratton, Ceballos, & Sheely, 2008).

Wilkins (1995) proposed a creative therapies model of group supervision with counselors as a way to address process issues, conceptualization issues, and personalization issues. Bratton, Ceballos, and Sheely (2008) stated that expressive arts in supervision could foster self-awareness, enhance client conceptualization, encourage exploration, and help clarify supervisees' theoretical framework. Expressive art supervision has the potential to help supervisees express thoughts, feelings, and experiences that they may not be able to fully verbalize (Bratton, Ray, & Landreth, 2008; Bratton, Ceballos, & Sheely, 2008). Supervisees are also able to utilize mediums and experience processes that can be used with clients of all ages (Bratton, Ceballos, & Sheely, 2008). Experiential creative arts techniques in supervision are designed to help supervisees develop meaning, increase learning, and enhance supervision (Deaver & Shiflett, 2011).

Discussions of creativity in counseling and counselor training can be found throughout the literature. Theorists such as Rollo May (1975), Virginia Satir (1972), and Violet Oaklander (1978/2007) emphasize the importance of creative methods and art in helping professions. According to Carson and Becker (2004), "Creativity should be viewed as a necessary foundation for effective counseling and counselor training" (p. 114). Creative arts in supervision has been largely explored by play therapist writers and researchers. Luke (2008) described the use of play in supervision of play therapies and Bratton Ceballos, & Sheely (2008) explored and provided case examples for using expressive arts in supervision of play therapists to facilitate awareness. Visual representation of counseling experiences, using modalities such as play, sand tray, and drawing, add depth to the therapeutic and supervision experience.

Statement of the Problem

The use of expressive arts in counseling supervision is a relatively new phenomenon (Bratton , Ceballos, and Sheely, 2008), and various creative techniques have been explored in the supervision of counselors and others in the helping professions (Schuck & Wood, 2011). While creative and expressive arts have been explored in counseling, supervision, and other related therapies (Atkins & Williams, 2007; Bratton Ceballos, & Sheely, 2008; Dunbar, 2011; Gladding, 2011; Malchiodi, 2007; Rogers, 1993; Schuck & Wood, 2011), there is little research examining CITs' perception of creative arts in group supervision (Neswald-McCalip, Sather, Strati, & Dineen, 2003; Rossi, 2010) and its perceived effects on the counselor.

Purpose of the Study

Supervision is intended to monitor and foster the development of CITs; therefore, research in supervision is in the best interest of the global community (Bernard & Goodyear, 2009). Counselor educators and supervisors seek to develop and implement new and innovative methods of supervision that encourage professional development among counseling students as well as ensure the safety of the clients of these new counselors. Creative practices such as art, music, and sculpting are used throughout counseling and supervision; however, perceptions of CITs participating in supervision that specifically utilizes creative arts methods are missing from the literature. The purpose of the current study is to examine CITs' perceptions of the use of various creative arts methods in group supervision and the perceived effects on the counselor.

Research Questions

The overarching research question for guiding the current inquiry is, "How do counselors-in-training perceive the experience of participating in group supervision utilizing

creative arts methods?” The secondary research questions, which are more specific, include: How do counselors-in-training: (a) perceive the impact of group supervision that utilizes creative arts methods? (b) perceive the impact of group supervision utilizing creative arts methods on case conceptualization with current clients? and (c) perceive the impact of group supervision utilizing creative arts methods on their development as counselors?

Significance of the Study

Creative arts play a vital part in the world’s history and have long been a part of the mental health profession (Gladding, 2011). The use of creative arts in counseling and other therapies is well-documented in the literature (Atkins & Williams, 2007; Bratton, Ceballos, & Sheely, 2008; Hammond & Gantt, 1998; Malchiodi, 2007; Rogers, 1993) and is often re-examined (Carson & Baker, 2004). However, there are limited empirical studies of creativity in counseling and in supervision (Neswald-McCalip et al., 2003; Rossi, 2010). Yet, the study of creativity in counseling is imperative to the profession’s continuation, which is at the forefront of the helping professions (Gladding, 2008). Creative arts in therapy facilitate connectedness, energy, reflection, and socialization (Gladding, 2011). Gladding (2011) identifies the relevance of the use of creative arts in counseling: (1) art is a way in which people connect their minds and bodies; (2) art requires action and energy and, therefore, gets individuals moving; (3) art creates a visual representation of thoughts, feelings, and goals; (4) counseling is creative; (5) art may help individuals seeking to establish a new sense of self; (6) art moves the abstract to concrete; (7) art provides insight; and (8) art is centered on socialization and cooperation.

The same rationale applies to the supervision process. Just like in the counseling process, the aforementioned activities may help supervisees generate thoughts about their experiences,

both personal and professional, as well as thoughts in relation to their clients. Several researchers have explored the use of creative arts in counseling (Carson & Baker, 2004; Gladding, 1998, 2008, 2011; Ray, Perking, & Odem, 2004; Rogers, 1993) and the use of creative processes in supervision is frequently studied in counselor education and supervision (Bratton, Ceballos, & Sheely, 2008; Deaver & Shiflett, 2011; Dunbar, 2011; Koltz, 2008; McNichols, 2010; O'Brien, 2006/2007; Schuck & Wood, 2011). However, little attention has been given to the experiences of CITs in creative arts group supervision and their perceptions of the impact of such processes. In the current study, I seek to better understand creative arts in group supervision by giving voice to the participant experience and perceived effects.

Population and Sample

In the current study, participants included five Master's level CITs completing internships at a Counseling and Training Clinic (CTC) on the campus of a university in the southwestern region of the United States. These CITs were gaining clinical experience as a part of a requirement in counseling and were providing services to clients with various concerns. All CITs working at the CTC were invited to participate in the study; however, only those who volunteered to participate in the study were interviewed and invited to attend the focus group session. Participants were not chosen based on any demographic criteria (e.g., age, sex, religion, ethnicity).

Instrumentation and Creative Arts Activities

Belfiore and Bennett (2007) argued that the current means to assess the impact of arts on society are largely incomplete, concluding that the impact of art should be understood through experience as opposed to attempting to develop a protocol for assessment. Considering the

difficulty of measuring the impact of art experiences on individuals and the goal of this study—to understand CITs’ experiences with creative arts and the effects of creative arts in group supervision—a qualitative research method was chosen to answer the research question.

In congruence with the qualitative nature of this study, journaling, individual interviews, focus group, field observation, and photographs were utilized to provide answers to the research questions guiding this inquiry. Group supervision of CITs, in which a variety of creative arts mediums were explored, began in the second week of the Fall 2012 academic semester and continued throughout the term. Each group session consisted of a supervised group activity, group discussion, and reflective journaling. The creative arts activities selected were chosen due to their references in the counseling literature. The order in which each activity was presented to the group was based on the materials required and the level of control associated with the activity (Oaklander, 1978/2007).

Activity 1: Introductions through Personal Roadmap or Timeline

Participants engaged in self-exploration by creating either a timeline or a map of their current positions in the process of becoming a counselor. They used colored pencils and butcher paper to illustrate the paths they took to reach the current point in their lives and the direction in which they are headed. This activity is designed to foster reflective thinking, conceptualization of current situations, and goals for the future. Group discussion of the maps and timelines created fostered introductions for group members. Curry (2009) presented the use of timeline in the counseling process to help clients with spirituality issues. She stated, “there are a myriad of ways that counselors can use timelines” (p. 121).

Activity 2: Exploring Concepts through Photographs and Images

Participants were asked to bring in multiple photographs: one or two meaningful personal photographs, one or two photographs that represent the “counselor,” and one or two photographs that represent “healing.” The photos could be found photograph(s), images, or personal photo(s). All CITs had the opportunity to view the photographs brought in by other members of the group, and group discussion was initiated to explore and discuss the different perceptions of each of the concepts represented by the photographs. Photographs can be used to “provide a visual aid to enhance” (p. 69) understanding of an individual’s life and world (Amerikaner, Schauble, & Ziller, 1980).

Activity 3: Rosebush Fantasy Technique

I led participants through the Rosebush Fantasy Technique (Oaklander, 1997, 1978/2007; Ray et al., 2004). This structured activity is designed to help CITs share their “feelings, ideas, perceptions, fantasies, and observations about self, others, and the environment” (Ray et al., 2004, p. 277). A series of questions from Ray et al. (2004) and Oaklander (1997, 1978/2007) were posed to stimulate a discussion of the activity as well as participants’ strengths and challenges.

Activity 4: Creature Creation

Each participant created a model of himself or herself as a “creature” using model magic (a light-weight modeling compound) and other decorative pieces such as feathers, stones, fabric, and pipe cleaners. Participants also responded verbally to prompts related to their strengths, weaknesses, and perceptions of the creature they created. This activity is designed to foster self-awareness (Bratton Ceballos, & Sheely, 2008).

Activity 5: Sand Tray

Sand tray, when used in supervision, can facilitate symbolic thinking and awareness of the supervisee's personal counseling style (Andrade, 2009). Study participants used a sand tray to create a scene that represented where they were in a certain client-counselor relationship. Participants described their scenes as well as the understanding they gained from engaging in this scene-development process. Participants took turns creating their scenes while the other members of the group reflectively observed.

Activity 6: Painting an Emotion

Participants used paint to represent an emotion or feeling associated with the current state of either their development as a counselor or their experience with a client. According to Oaklander (1978/2007), using paint lends itself well to states of feeling. Upon completion of the painting, participants presented their work to the group and discussed the meaning and emotions associated with the experience of creating the painting.

Activity 7: Music to Relate

“Messages being sent through music that are part of popular culture that may promote health or pathology” (Gladding, 2011, p. 38). Participants shared at least two pieces of music that they felt represented either the work they were doing with a specific client or a client's current situation. This activity is designed to bring about cohesion between situations being addressed as well as assisted them in relating to their clients through a medium they regularly experienced in daily life.

Activity 8: Constructing a Concern through Clay

Participants were given clay and instructed to construct anything that emerges (Oaklander, 1978/2007; Rogers, 1993) with respect to a client, client concern, or themselves as counselors. This activity was completed by each participant individually and was followed by a group discussion. At the end of this session, participants created a group sculpture to represent the entire group.

Activity 9: Found Poems

Participants created a *found poem* by first doing a quick writing concerning exactly where they were in relation to their development as counselors. Upon completion of the quick write, participants identified significant words from the entry and used them to create a found poem (McNichols, 2010). Participants shared and discussed their poems with the group.

Activity 10: Collage to Explore Concepts

Participants used various images to create a collage that reflected the weekly group supervision and their own experience with clients throughout the semester. Participants used images from magazines that stood out to them. Magazines, scissors, glue and construction paper was provided. Upon completion of this activity the group shared their work and discussed the activity as well as the completion of the group. Collages can be used in supervision to help supervisees develop metaphors and make them concrete (Amundson, 1988)

The weekly activities (see appendix F) were designed to incorporate the use of creativity within Bernard's (1997) discrimination model framework. This approach incorporates both art and research (Koltz, 2008) and aids in understanding of CITs' experiences concerning their personal development, the way these CITs conceptualize their clients, and the way to incorporate

arts into counseling practice. During each exercise, I served as a counselor, consultant, and teacher (Bernard & Goodyear, 2009). Upon completion of the study, semi-structured individual interviews with each participant were conducted to discuss the use of creative arts in supervision and its perceived effect on their development as counselors. A focus group session was also conducted following the initial analysis of data collected from journal entries and review of individual interviews.

Data Analysis

Data was collected from various sources, including journal entries, individual interviews, focus group, and researcher field notes. All data was transcribed and coded after it was collected. Grounded theory methods were utilized to deconstruct and reconstruct participants' experiences and perceptions of effect. Data analysis methods are aligned with Chamaz (2006). Initial coding was used to organize and find meaning within the data, including line-by-line and word-by-word analysis. I identified, categorized, and labeled any visible connections across the various data sources. Focused coding was done to "synthesize and explain larger segments of data" (2006, p. 57). Chapter 3 contains a more detailed description of data analysis, and Chapters 4 and 5 will present a discussion of themes emerging from the data.

Basic Assumptions

Prior to beginning the current study, I assumed that creative elements would indeed be meaningful to the study participants (CITs); I also assumed that participants would be open to participating in experiential creative arts exercises associated with self-reflection. I presumed that the activities chosen for the study would evoke interpersonal, social, and/or professional development among study participants. Finally, I assumed that these activities would trigger self-

awareness for CITs, as identified in counseling and supervision literature (Bernard & Goodyear, 2009; Borders, 1990; Bratton, Ceballos, & Sheely, 2008).

Researcher Bias

Creativity and creative exploration are deeply connected to both my personal and professional life. As a supervisor, I often use creative exercises with CITs to facilitate an in-depth understanding of client conceptualization and the supervisee's role in the counseling process. I strive to help CITs understand their work with clients from a variety of angles so that they have a better understanding of effective intervention, case conceptualization, and their positions in the process; this is often done through the use of creative interventions. As the researcher and supervisor of the CITs, I was closely connected to the study (Charmaz, 2006) and therefore could not be completely objective. I kept a journal of my own observations and reactions, which served as a way to note and bracket my personal experiences each week.

Limitations of the Study

There are several limitations to the current study. One limitation is that CITs from only one university clinic participated in the study, which limited the range of CIT experiences. In addition, the fact that participants knew they were being observed may have led them to behave in atypical ways. A third limitation is that observations, which were used to collect data, are focused on external behaviors (Patton, 2002). Using interviews to collect data also has limitations, as responses can be distorted due to bias, emotional state, and recall error (Patton, 2002). Finally, because I was the researcher as well as the supervisor of the study participants, participants may have altered their behavior and interview responses as a means of self-preservation.

Definitions of Key Terms

The following terms and abbreviations will be used throughout the current study:

Counselor-in-training (CIT): Master's level counseling students who received supervision during clinical portion of course work.

Counseling and Training Clinic (CTC): The specific location where counselors-in-training (study participants) were (a) gaining clinical hours toward their degrees, (b) working with persons seeking counseling services, and (c) receiving individual site supervision and group supervision.

Council for the Accreditation of Counseling and Related Educational Programs (CACREP): "An independent agency recognized by the Council for Higher Education Accreditation to accredit Master's degree programs in counseling and doctoral degree programs in counselor education" (CACREP, 2012, para. 1).

Creativity: The quality of being creative; the ability to create; the ability to make new things or think of new ideas (Creativity, n.d.).

Creative arts: Purposely selected activities that bring into being important ideas or feelings.

Expressive arts: Movement, sound, painting, sculpting, music, drawing, writing, and improvisation (Roger, 1993), imagery, symbol, storytelling, ritual, dance, poetry, drama "used together to give shape and form to human experiences, to hold and reflect experiences, and to expand and deepen personal understanding and meaning" (Atkins & Williams, 2007, p 1).

Group supervision: Supervision that occurs with a minimum of 3 and maximum of 12 counselors-in-training (CITs) (CACREP, 2009).

Supervision: Intervention by a senior member of a profession with a junior member or members of that same profession to enhance the junior member's functioning, monitor the quality services, and serve as a gatekeeper for the profession (Bernard & Goodyear, 2009).

Supervisor: A senior counseling professional who is responsible for monitoring the interventions and development of a junior therapist (Bernard & Goodyear, 2009).

Summary

This chapter provided an overview of the current research inquiry. The purpose of this study was to understand the experiences and perceived effect of creative arts group supervision on counselor development. Existing literature suggests that creative arts in supervision can foster an increased sense of self-awareness among CITs as well as enhance the supervision experience. Group supervision of five CITs was conducted over the course of one semester at the CTC. Given the unique and complex nature of the impact of art, a qualitative research method is appropriate. Chapter 2 will present a review of the literature concerning creative arts, creative arts in helping professions, clinical supervision, group supervision, counselor development, creative approaches in counselor training and supervision and considerations for using art in research study. Chapter 3 contains a detailed description of data collection and analysis. Chapter 4 will present the participants' voices through a detailed report of findings. Finally, Chapter 5 will describe the ways creative arts methods in supervision are applicable to the supervision of CITs as well as recommendations for future studies.

CHAPTER 2: LITURATURE REVIEW

In this chapter, I will explore the professional literature on clinical supervision and group supervision, as well as creative arts, creative arts in therapy and creative arts in counselor supervision. This study is interested in perceived effect on development of the CIT; therefore, extensive review of literature on counselor development will be explored. Creativity and creative arts are by no means new to the helping professions; however, clear definitions of methods and parameters for using them can vary. A review of creative approaches to CIT supervision in professional literature, theoretical and empirical, as well as considerations for using art in a research study is provided.

Clinical Supervision

This study sought to understand CITs' experiences of group supervision utilizing creative arts methods as well as their perceptions about the effect of participation. Therefore, an examination of group supervision was warranted. There are multiple methods and theories for providing supervision to CITs; however, literature concerning group supervision is limited.

Clinical supervision in counselor training occurs when a more senior member of the profession monitors and mentors a more junior member of the profession (Bernard, 1979). While the concept of supervision is present in early counseling literature, supervision literature is "still very much in its infancy," (p. 413) particularly in the areas of working alliance, countertransference, and parallel process, and there is a need for more empirical research in these areas (Watkins, 2010). Professional clinical supervision should be examined to best serve supervisees and ultimately insure the best care for the clients seen by these counselor during their training and professional practice.

Supervision spans across helping professions and with the changing nature of client issues and client care it is imperative to understand diverse ways of working with developing counselors. “Supervisors need to be challenged to not merely accept their supervision styles but to be open to further learning” for themselves and their students (Fernando & Hulse-Killacky, 2005, p. 300). Continued development and knowledge of counselor development as a part of supervision benefits the professional as a whole. Supervisors who are adept using multiple styles of supervision allow a variety of personal and professional learning needs to be met among student counselors (Fernando & Hulse-Killacky, 2005).

Various types of supervision are utilized in the helping professions. Bernard (1992) discussed a number of different models of supervision, including psychotherapy-based, developmental models, alternative (non-developmental) conceptual models, parallel process, and personal growth supervision. Clinical supervisors may approach supervision utilizing one of these particular models or they may adapt their supervision to include a combination of these models. According to Pearson (2006), removing counseling theory from supervision is “neither feasible nor desirable” (p. 241). Pearson (2006) discussed theory-driven supervision and integrating counseling theories, expressing that “Strengths that each theoretical approach brings to the counseling setting are echoed in the strengths they bring to the supervision environment” (p. 242). Examples of this include the use of play in supervision of play therapists (Luke, 2008), group supervision with group counselors, and cognitive-behavioral supervision with counselors working in clinical mental health agencies. Utilizing a specific theory-based model in supervision with CITs working from the same theory-based approach allows the CITs to experience the activities and processes of that particular model first hand. Pearson (2006)

identified two concerns regarding the rigid application of theory-based models in supervision. These concerns include “minimizing the educational needs of supervisees and failing to monitor client progress and welfare” (Pearson, 2006, p. 243).

Theoretical approaches to counseling are intended to prompt growth and change in clients; therefore, using theoretical models of supervision may be as useful in promoting growth and change in supervisees (Pearson, 2006). It is important to consider the differences in therapy and supervision with transferring modalities from one setting to another. The difference between supervision and therapy is that supervision is more educational than it is therapeutic (Bernard, 1992; Pearson 2006). Yet, supervision often includes the modeling of therapeutic conditions balanced with the awareness of supervision limits. Instruction and evaluation are also distinct differences in supervision and counseling (Bernard, 1992). Balancing the needs of the supervisee with the need to evaluate performance may be difficult, but client care is ultimately the most important aspect of supervision (Bernard, 1992).

Role-based supervision, in contrast with theory-based supervision, is the practice of supervision using a role-based model such as Bernard’s (1997) discrimination model. In this model, the supervisor alternately fills the role of counselor, consultant, and teacher depending on the needs of the supervisee at a given time. Pearson (2006) argues for the use of both by incorporating the discrimination model into theory-based supervision. According to Pearson (2006):

Incorporating these three roles (counselor, consultant, teacher) into psychotherapy-based supervision not only provides some direction for utilizing therapeutic skills in supervision, it also offers an avenue for filling in the missing links related to instruction,

evaluation, and client progress . . . Applying a psychotherapy-driven approach incorporates the best of both models by encouraging supervisors to bring all their theoretical approaches and skills into supervision while intentionally and flexibly incorporating the supervisor roles of teacher, counselor, and consultant. (p. 247)

Combining social role-based supervision and theory-based approaches allows a supervisor to utilize the strength of both (Pearson, 2006). Incorporating art-based techniques or creative arts interventions into social role-based supervision merges artistic and researched-based thought into the supervision process.

Group Supervision

According to Bernard and Goodyear (2009), group supervision is widely used in training settings and universities. It is required as part of the educational requirements of counseling degree programs accredited by CACREP (2009). Bernard and Goodyear (2009) defined group supervision as

The regular meeting of a group of supervisees (a) with a designated supervisor or supervisors, (b) to monitor the quality of their work, and (c) to further their understanding of themselves as clinicians, of the clients with whom they work, and of service delivery in general (p. 244).

There is no particular number of supervisees required to constitute a group; however, six to eight is optimal (Bernard & Goodyear, 2009). Bernard and Goodyear also explored benefits and limits to group supervision. Benefits of group supervision include opportunity for vicarious learning, breadth of client exposure, normalizing of supervisee experiences, and the opportunity to generate a parallel process for supervisees to apply what they have learned. Limitations of group

supervision include potential problems with confidentiality, the possibility that learning will be hindered by group phenomena, and the fact that the group may spend too much time on irrelevant issues for some supervisees (2009).

Bernard and Goodyear (2009) identified group supervision practice as one that will continue to be widely utilized with CITs. They highlighted the need for more empirical attention to development and testing of group supervision models. Group supervision is used nearly as much as individual supervision (Bernard & Goodyear, 2009); however, there is little research on the process or about supervisee perceptions of what is helpful (Carter et al, 2009). In an effort to address this lack of information, Carter et al. (2009) analyzed responses of 49 graduate psychology students and identified 66 helpful events in group supervision. The events were analyzed and resulted in five clusters of helpful events: (1) supervisor impact (2) specific instruction, (3) self-understanding, (4) support and safety, (5) peer impact.

Starling and Baker (2000) conducted an analysis of retrospective phenomenological interviews of four CITs who had participated in group supervision. Four themes emerged from their study, including (1) decreased confusion and anxiety during the group experience, (2) formation of clear goals, (3) increased confidence, and (4) enhancement of the process by feedback from peers. Starling and Baker recommended observations and feedback from peers in group supervision focus on the specifics, assuming the role of the client, analyzing from a theoretical perspective, and utilizing descriptive metaphor to characterize the counselor, client, relationship, or process.

Christensen and Kline (2008) developed the process sensitive peer group supervision model. This model of supervision was “developed to incorporate group process dynamics and

supervision concepts” (2008, p 81). Christensen and Kline provided a conceptualization of the processes of the peer group supervision model including three phases. Phase 1, passive involvement, marked the initial interactions between the group members and their dependency on the supervisor to facilitate. Phase 2, learning responsibility, included increased supervisee involvement and decreased supervisor facilitation. In Phase 3, personal involvement, group interaction and supervisee feedback became a vital component of the process. This research provides an initial understanding of the process of peer group supervision. The authors found that this model influenced supervisees’ confidence, self-trust, and willingness to take responsibility in their process of learning (2008). Christensen and Kline also recommend further research in understanding supervisees’ perceptions.

Creative Arts

The term creative arts, while used often, is difficult to define. Things that may come to mind when thinking of creative arts include arts and crafts, a hobby, something done in residential treatment facilities to cheer up patients, or something to be done in grade school to keep children busy. The best way to begin to understand creative arts is to begin by deconstructing the term.

Rollo May (1975) discussed creativity in great length. May stated that there are two forms of creativity. There is the superficial pseudo aesthetic form, which is the concept of making things prettier, and there is the concept that creativity is to “bring something new into being” (1975, p39). May’s latter conception of creativity can be applied to this study.

Now we must make the above distinction clear if our inquiries into creativities are to get below the surface... Creativity must be seen in the work of the scientist as well as in that

of the artist, in the thinker as well as in the aesthetician . . . Creativity, as Webster's rightly indicates, is basically the process of making, of bringing into being (1975, p. 40). Today, Merriam-Webster defines *creativity* as "the quality of being creative; the ability to create" and "the ability to make new things or think of new ideas" (Creativity, n.d.). Similarly, *creative* is defined as "using the ability to make or think of new things: involving the process by which new ideas, stories, etc, are created" (Creative, n.d.).

Arts, defined by Merriam-Webster, is

Something that is created with imagination and skill and that is beautiful or that expresses important ideas or feelings; an activity that is done to create something beautiful or to express important ideas or feelings; painting, sculpting, music, theater, literature, etc., considered as a group of activities done by people with skill and imagination (Arts, n.d.).

Even today, nearly forty years after Rollo May (1975) discussed creativity in *The Courage to Create*, art is defined in terms of aesthetics and deeper meaning or thought. With this, it is not a surprise that there is little clarity in the definition of creativity, arts, and, therefore, creative arts, and confusion among artists and scientists. For the purposes of this study, creative art is defined as an activity that brings into being important ideas or feelings.

Various cultures communicate and can be understood through art in powerful and effective ways (Malchiodi, 2007). According to Malchiodi (2007), art images can aid in self-understanding, help us express feelings and ideas that words cannot, and enhance life through self-expression. There is a rich history of the use of art in helping professions and numerous reasons for the existence of creative arts in therapy (Gladding, 2011). In counseling, creative arts interventions aid in feelings of connectedness, give individuals energy, focus on the concepts

being explored, and helps client establish a new sense of self (2011). Some may see art as something for children, a distraction, a hobby, or something seen only in museums; however, activities like scribbling, drawing, and thinking about their meaning are soothing, as these things relieve stress and tension, provide joy, and transcend troubled feelings (Malchiodi, 2007).

Creative Art in Therapy

Art and creative arts can be used in multiple kinds of helping relationships (Malchiodi, 2007), such as counseling (Gladding, 1998, 2008, 2011; Carson & Baker, 2003, 2004), expressive art therapy (Atkins & Williams, 2007; Rogers, 1993), family therapy (Carson, 1999), and play therapy (Bratton, Ray, & Landreth, 2008; Oaklander, 1997, 1978/2007). Creative techniques may also be used in counselor training (Waliski, 2008) and supervision (Bratton, Ceballos, & Sheely, 2008; Deaver & Shiflett, 2011; Dunbar, 2011; Koltz, 2008; Newsome, Henderson, & Veach, 2005). Creative art therapies include use of art, music, dance, drama, poetry, psychodrama (National Coalition of Creative Art Therapies Association, 2013), play, sand tray, bibliotherapy, and creative writing (Malchiodi, 2008), as well as imagery, literature, humor (Gladding, 2011), journaling, drama, and meditation (Rogers, 1993).

The definition of creativity has also been examined within the mental health profession. Gladding (2011) used the term divergent thinking when defining creativity, and stated that creativity in therapy results in a tangible product that gives insight and leads to change. Malchiodi (2007) defined creativity as “the ability to bring something new and unique into existence; as a union of opposites, impressions, ideas, and concepts that initially seem unrelated; or as giving birth to a new idea” (p. 65). Malchiodi cautioned about emphasis on an overarching definition, and encouraged a focus instead on qualities and characteristics of creativity. She

noted that spontaneity, playfulness, imagination, motivation, originality, self-expression, inventiveness, divergent thinking, and intuition are all qualities of creativity (2007).

The use of expressive arts in therapy is a growing trend (Rogers, 1993), as their use helps a person tap into his or her “intuitive and creative powers” (Malchiodi, 2007, p. 1). Creativity can be used in conjunction with a variety of therapeutic modalities, such as solution-focused counseling, narrative therapy (Malchiodi, 2007), play therapy (Kottman, 2003), and person-centered therapy (Rogers, 1993). Rogers (1993) believed that everyone has the ability to be creative, and stated that “what is creative is frequently therapeutic . . . what is therapeutic is frequently a creative process” (p. 1). Creativity and the use of creative arts are present in the professional counseling literature as well as other helping professions such as family therapy and play therapy (Atkins & Williams, 2007; Gladding, 2011; Rogers, 1993).

Creativity in Counseling

Creative interventions and creative arts in counseling is a rapidly growing component of the counseling profession. The establishment of The Association for Creativity in Counseling, a division of the American Counseling Association, in 2004 and the publishing of the *Journal for Creativity in Mental Health* is evidence of the significant presence of creativity as a component of the professional identity of counselors. In *The Creative Arts in Counseling*, Gladding (2011) identified nine reasons for using creative arts in counseling. These include: (1) means for helping individuals become integrated and connected, essentially more congruent; (2) require and help develop new energy; (3) require focus, forcing clients to attend to their goals; (4) enriches and expands participants processes; (5) helps clients establish a new sense of self; (6) concreteness helps clients conceptualize and recreate beneficial activities; (7) the potential for increased

insight for the client and the counselor; (8) the potential for increased socialization and cooperation; and (9) creative arts are multicultural. In short, creative arts can help clients from different cultures, in different ways, and in different circumstances (2011). Current examples of creative arts in counseling addressed in the literature include digital storytelling (Sawyer & Willis, 2011), mindful music listening (Eckhardt & Dinsmore, 2012), drums and poems (Sassen, 2012), photography (Ginicola, Smith, & Trzaska, 2012), creative computer software (Evans, 2012), and pictures (Loewenthal, 2013).

Family Therapy

Family therapists also utilize creativity and creative arts therapeutically in sessions with families (Carson, 1999). This may include family play therapy (Botkin, 2000), filial therapy (Landreth & Bratton, 2006), and family sculpting (Gladding, 2011), all of which can engage young children in sessions (Borda, 2011). Genograms and family drawings can facilitate in-depth understanding of the family structure (Satir, 1972). Because of the non-verbal aspects of creative arts, “families and counselors are able to grasp members’ experiences, boundaries, and alliances more easily and immediately” (Gladding, 2011, p. 75).

Play Therapy

Creative arts interventions, play therapy, and art therapy are often used with children. Through these methods, helping professionals are able to help children communicate beyond their verbal development and gain insight. Children naturally create their own learning (Sawyer et al., 2003); therefore, offering children a space to create is natural and developmentally appropriate. Various individuals (e.g., Oaklander, Kottman) have laid the groundwork for

working with children within a helping relationship utilizing creative arts and art-based interventions, as well as play.

“Therapy is an art; unless one can combine skills and knowledge and experiences with an inner intuitive, creative, flowing sense, probably not much will happen” (Oaklander, 1978/2007, p. 194). While working with children, Oaklander (1978/2007) used fantasy and drawing; making things with clay, dough, water, wood, collage, pictures; storytelling, poetry, and puppets; enactment; sensory expression such as music, touch, meditation, feelings; and sand tray and games. Oaklander (1978/2007) discussed the use of projection in child therapy. Projection is the “basis for all artistic and scientific creativity” and “in therapy it is a very valuable tool” (p. 193). According to Oaklander (1978/2007), projection tells us a lot about ourselves because it comes from within. This method has the ability to bring about vulnerabilities and should be handled with extreme care. Children will often tell a puppet, draw in picture, and re-enact some things that they will never directly tell an adult. Oaklander (1978/2007) stated, “Often projection is the only way that the child will be willing to disclose herself” (p. 193).

Adlerian play therapists use art-based techniques to help children gain insight into their own lifestyles during the exploration stage of therapy (Kottman, 2003). Kottman (2003) used art therapy techniques to explore the family atmosphere and family constellation, and to help children gain insight. Kottman stated, “Therapists must not feel limited to these particular applications of creative arts techniques” (p. 183). Art-based techniques that use symbolic representation and metaphoric dialogue can help children to understand their thoughts, feelings and reactions (Kottman, 2003).

Modalities used in therapy are often reflected in supervision and vice versa (Bernard, 1992; Pearson, 2006). Next I will examine the use of creative arts in supervision.

Creative Approaches in Counselor Supervision

Creative and expressive arts in supervision can foster self-awareness, enhance client conceptualization, encourage exploration, and help clarify supervisees' theoretical framework (Bratton, Ceballos, and Sheely, 2008). Creative and expressive art supervision may also have the potential to help supervisees express thoughts, feelings, and experiences that they may not be able to fully verbalize (Bratton, Ray, & Landreth, 2008; Bratton, Ceballos, & Sheely, 2008). By utilizing creative arts in supervision, supervisees are able to experience techniques that could be used with clients (Bratton, Ceballos, & Sheely, 2008). Experiential creative arts techniques in supervision are designed to help supervisees develop meaning, increase learning, and enhance supervision (Deaver & Shiflett, 2011). The creative supervisor can open unconscious communication, evoke physical and emotional reactions, and increase awareness of non-verbal communication and unconscious processes (Schuck & Wood, 2011).

Several studies and conceptual articles have examined creative arts in supervision and training of CITs. These studies provided evidence that creative arts in group supervision impacts the CIT. Various studies have indicated impact associated with personal awareness (Gurffrida, Jordan, Saiz, and Barns, 2007), group cohesion (Newsome et al., 2005; Sheflett, 2011), and personal and professional growth (Rossi, 2010, Wilson & Ziomek-Daigle, 2013). These studies are examined below.

Metaphor and the use of metaphorical activities have been proposed in counselor training and supervision (Gurffrida, et al., 2007; Robert and Kelly, 2010). Robert and Kelly (2010)

explored metaphor in counselor education and training to enhance interventions strategies, counselor-client relationships, and case conceptualization interventions strategies. The authors provided case studies and offered suggestions about how to use metaphor in training and practice. Robert and Kelly stated that client-generated metaphors can be used to aid in case-conceptualization and CIT-generated metaphors can be used to help clients form mental images that contribute to their progress. The use of metaphor in counselor training helps CITs become more comfortable with the use of metaphor in session and as a means for conceptualizing clients and their concerns (Robert and Kelly, 2010).

Similarly, Gurffrida et al. (2007) proposed the use of metaphor in supervision as a way to help students “understand the process of becoming a counselor and facilitate student’s case conceptualization skills” (p. 393). The authors found that metaphoric activities generally did one of two things: (1) helped supervisees understand the process of becoming a counselor through self-understanding and awareness or (2) facilitated case conceptualization. Gurffrida et al. (2007) explored metaphorical activities such as drawing, stories, and sand tray; however, they suggest that more qualitative study is needed to fully understand the success of such methods in supervisee growth and development.

In another conceptual article, Newsome et al. (2005) explored the use of expressive arts in group supervision to enhance awareness and foster cohesion. They noted that the advantages of creativity in counseling also apply to supervision (Newsome et al., 2005), and that “intentionally selected expressive arts activities” in group supervision can foster “personal awareness and increase group understanding and cohesion” (p. 145). Creative arts allow supervisees to think outside the box and see things in new ways, engaging the emotional,

perceptual, and creative world of the supervisee (Newsome et al., 2005). Newsome et al. stated, “when supervisors purposefully select activities, allow sufficient time for reflection and debriefing, and encourage interactive feedback, expressive arts can enhance the supervision process in multiple ways” (p. 155). Authors also highlighted ethical issues when using creativity and art in supervision, such as boundaries between counseling and supervision, how and when to use expressive arts in supervision, and confidentiality. Newsome et al. (2005) asserted that creative arts can help a supervisor create an atmosphere where students are supported and can thrive. The authors noted that their results were based on post-practicum and informal group surveys and reflections, and stated that there is a need for “more systematic investigation of the effectiveness of using creative activities to engender group cohesion as well as encourage professional development” (2005, p. 155), and suggested that qualitative analysis would provide “valuable descriptive information” (2005, p. 155).

Sheflett (2011) explored the integration of art-based techniques among group-supervised CITs. In this study, six doctoral-level supervisors were trained to use one art technique. Sheflett (2011) found that supervisors who received the training, prior to using them had positive outcomes in trainee development, client treatment, and the supervised group process. This researcher created a conceptual map to aid the integration of an art-based strategy into group supervision. This conceptual map identified how the process of integrating creative arts activities unfolds, major events in the process, and how supervisors and supervisees participate in the process, as well as outcomes of the process. The most important implication from this study, as identified by the researcher, is the training and competence in creative techniques gained by

supervisees as a result of the supervisor implementing such techniques. Sheflett (2011) suggests more investigation of varied purposeful art techniques and experiences relevant to CITs.

Rossi (2010), in a phenomenological exploration, examined the experiences of ten Master's level CITs in expressive arts group supervision. This 5-week research study included three weeks of art intervention (two activities per week) and two weeks of individual interviews. Expressive arts supervision took place in the CITs' internship class. Rossi found that process of using expressive arts in group supervision is a holistic process that can be divided into four phases: (1) initial reaction, (2) art engagement, (3) reflection, and (4) transformation. Participants in the study (Rossi, 2010) indicated that use of expressive arts contributed to their professional and personal growth. This research suggests a holistic process of engaging in art activities in supervision and that art activities influenced the growth of CITs personally and professionally.

Neswald-McCalip et al (2003) studied creative supervision with a group of CITs. In this study, supervisees were in charge of choosing the activities. Activities included Gestalt work, biofeedback, drawing, and use of modeling clay. The authors indicated that, "According to the students, creative supervision is a theoretical approach to supervising counseling students that includes necessary and sufficient conditions for personal, professional, and perhaps transpersonal growth to take place" (2003, p 235). Neswald-McCalip et al, based on findings in this study, proposed a generative model, in which each dimension builds on another and then recycles. They held that the regenerative model "empowers students to identify their own learning needs by integrating expressive arts activities within the supervision process" (p. 223), and allows supervisees to focus on emergent needs rather than the supervisor's agenda.

Wilson and Ziomek-Daigle (2013) examined trainees' perceptions of using art-based therapeutic techniques with high school students. A grounded theory analysis revealed a three-stage process, including apprehension/resistance, comfort, and counselor endorsement.

Participants had little experience with using expressive arts and were apprehensive about using them with high school students. However, through further engagement in the expressive arts, participants began to feel comfortable with the activities and eventually began to endorse such activities in counseling with high school students. This study suggested an element of apprehension CITs may have with using expressive arts; however, through personal experience they become more accepting and eventually conceive the use of expressive arts with clients.

In summary, research on creative and expressive arts in supervision to date indicates that such use has the ability to enhance awareness and foster cohesion (Newsome et al., 2005), as well as help students "understand the process of becoming a counselor and facilitate student's case conceptualization skills" (Gurffrida et al., 2007, p. 393). Research also suggests that creative arts in group supervision of CITs has a positive outcome on trainee development, client treatment, and group supervision process when the supervisor has prior training in the activities (Sheflett, 2011) and contributes to supervisee professional and personal growth (Rossi, 2010). This method of supervision can be described as a cycling process (Neswald-McCalip et al, 2003) as well as a process of moving from apprehension to endorsement of using such activities with particular clients (Wilson and Ziomek-Daigle, 2013). These studies provide clear indication that the use of creative arts in supervision impacts CITs in various ways as they develop as counselors.

Student Counselor Development

In the current study, I examined the experiences of CITs in group supervision utilizing various creative arts methods. Bernard and Goodyear (2009) identified fostering supervisee development as one of the two central purposes of supervision. A number of studies have addressed CIT development.

Furr and Carroll (2003) examined critical incidents in student counselor development. The authors looked at incidents critical to the development of 60 students enrolled in Master's degree programs, and they classified critical incidents into 9 categories: (1) existential issues/value conflicts, (2) cognitive development, (3) beliefs about competency, (4) professional development, (5) perceived support, (6) perceived obstacles, (7) personal growth (in the counseling program), (8) personal growth (outside the counseling program), and (9) skill development. They found that students grow both intrapersonally and interpersonally while enrolled in counselor education programs. Furr and Carroll reported that events occurring in field-based experiences were the most commonly reported. They also noted that there are a wide range of influences on student learning, and that experiential learning activities have greater emotional impact than traditional courses utilizing cognitive learning strategies. With regards to personal growth, results indicated that self-development activities in both beginning and advanced technique courses were the most frequently mentioned. Furr and Carroll (2003) stated that educators and supervisors of CITs "need to identify and examine experiences that influence counselor development" (p. 483), and noted that it is important to consider students' perspectives in any such examination. Furr and Carroll (2003) found that gaining personal awareness was important to CITs' development, and students reported that the amount of personal exploration

and self-examination was unexpected. The authors stated, “Students need a supportive environment to translate the stress of self-examination into personal growth” (2003, p. 488).

Howard et al. (2006) also examined critical incidents, and focused on practicum students at “significant learning moments, turning points, or moments of realization” (p. 88) contributing to their professional growth. The authors identified five themes regarding critical incidents experienced by novice counselors: (1) professional identity, (2) personal reactions, (3) competence, (4) supervision, and (5) philosophy of counseling (2006). According to the authors, CITs become more self-aware during the practicum experience, struggle with feelings of incompetence, and recognize critical moments in supervision. Howard et al. (2006) suggest these experiences and the impact of these experiences on training and the therapy process should be studied further.

Skovholt and Ronnestad (1992) studied therapist and counselor development. They found that “intense interpersonal experiences strongly influence professional development” (p. 512) of CITs, just as professional experiences impact personal development. Critical incidents influence CITs personally. The interpersonal experience of being reflective and asking for and receiving feedback is imperative to professional counselor development. Skovholt and Ronnestadt held that the therapeutic self “consists of a unique personal blend of the developed professional and personal selves,” (p. 507) and includes values and theoretical stance. These authors also discussed rigidity among CITs. They discussed themes in therapist and counselor development, which included professional development by way of professional individuation (combining professional and personal selves) and moving from a rigid (external) mode to looser (internal)

mode. They noted that novice counselors heavily rely on experts and external pressure early on in their careers; however, this is relaxed after graduation.

Kindsvatter et al. (2008) also discussed CIT rigidity, and found that “during periods of uncertainty or psychological distress, a supervisee may encounter or develop rigid or unhelpful thinking patterns that could delay development by promoting discouraging realities and experiences” (p. 179). This unhelpful thinking may be subtle and out of supervisees’ awareness, Supervisees may also experience cognitive distortions, during times of stress, which reflects their highly vulnerable state (2008). These cognitive distortions and negative thoughts about their counseling career, the profession, and/or the therapy process can remain throughout a counselor’s career if these issues are not addressed early (Kindsvatter et al., 2008).

Auxier, Hughes, and Kline (2003) studied identity development experiences of master’s level counselor education students. This research was achieved through two rounds of individual interviews and one focus group. The authors stated that understanding identity development grounded in experiences helps counselor educators provide educational and supervisory experiences that are beneficial to CITs. They found participants struggle to clearly define interpersonal and counseling identity, and described how CITs “questioned their self-concepts as developing counselors” (p. 37). Auxier et al. (2003) also described the recycling identity formation process. This process includes conceptual learning, experiential learning, and external evaluation. Across the identification and clarification process, CIT attitudes change as they become more confident as counselors and they become more autonomous as they progress through their programs of study. In addition, the authors found that as students move through their programs of study, experiential learning becomes more important, and that these

experiences can generate an emotional response from students. Auxier et al. noted that CITs' confidence and professional self-identification is influenced by evaluation as well as progression through their program. They found that ongoing external evaluation can trigger anxiety in CITs and lead them to challenge their sense of self-concept. Auxier et al. (2003) stated that "When participants perceived external evaluation as validation of their impressions of themselves as counselors and persons, their anxiety diminished" (p. 33). The authors recommended counselor educators who see these findings as relevant to their programs "experiment with the application of the theory's concepts" (2003, p. 73)

Melton et al. (2005) conducted a study with first year counseling students participating in simulated counseling experiences. They found that CITs experience several emotions, which they call an emotional roller coaster, from inner experiences (i.e., internal processing and experiences in simulated counseling sessions). These emotions include (a) anger/frustration (lack of direction or focus), (b) disappointment/regret (missed connection), (c) anxiety/fear (trying new skills, how to respond to clients' emotions), and (d) happiness/excitement (effective, progress). In this study (Melton et al., 2005), CITs avoided these emotions by "falling silent and emotionally withdrawing from the session" (p. 93) as well as changing the topic, distancing themselves, and causing their levels of anxiety to increase. Melton et al. (2005) pointed out that emotionally charged reactions should be expected, and emotions differ in intensity and directly influence a session.

In summary, critical incidents are paramount in the development on CITs. The literature shows that trainees become increasingly rigid (external-oriented rigidity) during education and training (Kindsvatter et al., 2008; Skovholt & Ronnestad, 1992). Experiential learning produces a

greater emotional impact than more cognitive based learning methods (Furr & Carroll, 2003). Melton et al. (2005) suggested that supervisors should inform supervisees to be aware of the ways their emotions may influence a session. Counselor development should be balanced with personal growth and boundaries, as well as the counselor educator's role should be known (2003). Informed dialog "about the learning processes that are integral to the identity development of counselors and the significance of this process for counselor education can only occur when there is a substantial amount of published exploratory research in this area" (Auxier et al., 2003, p. 37)

Considerations for Art in a Research Study

Creating a dialogue around the use of creative and expressive art by mental health professionals increases awareness of ethical concerns associated with using them in both counseling and supervision (Hammond & Grantt, 1998). CIT protection and a safe space to connect during supervision are imperative. Creating an environment for art making is important and contributes to the creative process (Malchiodi, 2007). Just as Carl Rogers discussed the conditions for the therapeutic relationship, Natalie Rogers (1993) discussed the conditions for fostering creativity, which include psychological safety as well as unconditional warmth, without evaluation, and empathy as well as "psychological freedom" (p. 15). When introducing creative arts and expressive arts exercises into supervision it is important to consider the safety of the CITs participating. Hammond and Grantt (1998) explored the ethical considerations for the use of art in counseling. They concluded that: (1) art should be given the same consideration and protection as the spoken word when used in counseling, (2) not all clinicians are prepared to work with various art interventions, and (3) clinicians should not work outside of their areas of

competence. Supervisors also have an ethical obligation to protect their supervisees. Such considerations should also be made when engaging CITs in art and expressive exercises in supervision.

Rogers (1993) discussed the *creative connection*, which refers to multiple expressive art forms influencing each other, deepening experiences, and increasing self-acceptance. She intended individuals to use expressive arts to enhance self-awareness, deepen relationships, and enrich therapy. This could include playing music during a painting exercise, visual art and journaling, or movement and writing. Rogers (1993) stated that this connection can cause individuals to create from the unconscious. In doing this, the supervisor can help supervisees explore inner thoughts and feelings related to the counseling experience and themselves as a counselor. Hammond and Grantt (1998) stated that a well-trained counselor should be able to prompt a client to draw something they cannot verbally express or discuss a piece of art they created. Selecting specific interventions to meet the needs and developmental level of the group (Newsome et al., 2005) was an important consideration in the current inquiry.

Understating and interpretation of the art created or expressive experience that happened in the supervision session is another consideration when utilizing creative or expressive arts in supervision. Interpretation of art and play work done should not be interpreted without a certain level of awareness. Kottman (2003) uses a common sense approach to interpret drawings and other art created by children. While working with children and using their creative processes, Oaklander (1978/2007) described the process of communicating what is seen rather than interpreting the art or play product. Oaklander (1978/2007) stated that “interpretations are my own ideas, based on my own feelings and experiences, and I keep them tentative” (p. 193).

Summary

This study focused on gaining an in-depth understanding of the ways CITs perceive group supervision utilizing creative arts methods and its perceived effects on their case conceptualization and their development as counselors. This chapter was provided to examine the literature related to the current study. Group supervision, the use of creative arts in therapy and supervision, as well as counselor development and considerations for using art in a research study have been examined. The research and conceptual literature provide a context from which to view the current qualitative study.

CHAPTER 3: RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

The purpose of the current study is to provide an in-depth understanding of the ways CITs perceive the use of creative arts in group supervision and its perceived effects on their case conceptualization and their development as counselors. To probe this issue, I developed a study examining the use of creative arts in supervised groups of CITs. This chapter describes the study design and methodology.

Research Questions

The overarching research question guiding the current inquiry is: How do counselors-in-training perceive the experience of participating in group supervision utilizing creative arts methods? More specific sub-questions include: How do counselors-in-training: (a) perceive the impact of group supervision that utilizes creative arts methods? (b) perceive the impact of group supervision utilizing creative arts methods on case conceptualization with current clients? and (c) perceive the impact of group supervision utilizing creative arts methods on their development as counselors?

Rational for Qualitative Methodology

Initial conceptualization of CITs' experiences with arts-based supervision has been explored in the literature (Gurffrida, et al., 2007; Newsome et al., 2005; Rossi, 2010); therefore, I generally assumed that creative arts in a group-supervision setting could foster personal and professional growth, self-awareness of CITs, group cohesion, and case conceptualization. The research questions guiding the current study were designed to build on the existing literature and aid further conceptualization of these experiences. Therefore, in this study I strive to further understand the perceptions of CITs participating in group supervision using creative art, while

beginning the conceptualization of a theory for how impact occurs. A grounded theory method was adopted to balance the sensitivity of participants' lived experiences with scientific inquiry to aid further understanding of this phenomenon. "Grounded theory serves as a way to learn about the worlds we study and a method for developing theories to understand them" (Charmaz, 2006, p. 10). The primary aim of this study is the former, to study creative arts in group supervision. "Like any container into which different content can be poured, researchers can use basic grounded theory guidelines such as coding, memo-writing, and sampling for theory development, and comparative methods, are in many ways neutral" (Charmaz, 2006, p. 9).

Phenomenology with Grounded Theory Methods

Researchers using phenomenological approach attempt to understand how humans make sense of their experiences of a particular phenomenon and transform "experiences into consciousness, both individually and as shared meaning" (Patton, 2002, p. 104). A phenomenological approach "captures the essence of the lived experiences of the phenomenon for this person or group of people" (Patton, 2002, p. 132). Grounded theory is an approach that is traditionally used to develop theory about a particular phenomenon; however, it also offers methods of conducting systematic comparative analysis of data that is grounded in fieldwork to explain the phenomenon in question (Charmaz, 2006; Patton, 2002). According to Charmaz (2006) "Grounded theory methods can complement other approaches to qualitative data analysis, rather than stand opposite of them" (p. 9). These methods include: coding, memo writing, sampling for theory development, and comparative methods. Charmaz (2006) described these methods as a neutral guideline to construct a phenomenon. Therefore, I adopted a grounded theory method to construct an in-depth depiction of CITs' reality with the said phenomenon.

As the overarching goal of the study was to understand participant experiences, a phenomenological approach was appropriate. The use of grounded theory methods for data analysis provided a sound structure for analyzing data across time and from multiple sources in order to arrive at an in-depth understanding of participant experiences as well as a beginning understanding of the phenomenon.

Role of the Researcher

Charmaz (2006) noted that “We are a part of the world we study and the data we collect” (p. 10). I had multiple roles during the course of this study. As a part of the study I served as the group supervisor, observer, interpreter, and co-constructor. Also, at the time of the study, I served as site supervisor at the CTC where study participants were training. Per my role at the CTC, I supervised three of the five participants individually on a weekly basis, as well as monitored and provided feedback to other participants as needed. As an observer, I attempted to be present, open, and sensitive to participants’ experiences during group supervision. As an interpreter, I attempted to be reflective and aware of my own perceptions during group supervision; I maintained an active researcher journal. My own experiences in the group were expected to be meaningful and progressive, as I essentially took part in the experiences, just as other group members did, as a co-constructor.

Personal Experience

A supervisor, while discussing a play therapy case, asked me to think about reasons I would have gone to play therapy as a child. Puzzled by this, I asked my mother for direction, and she said, “I don’t know. You always had your own play therapy in your room.” I was fortunate, as a child, to have the freedom to play, to experience, to manipulate the world around me, and to

be creative. As I have gotten older, this creativity has remained with me. As an adult and even during my doctoral studies, I have used various creative outlets (e.g., photography, painting, drawing) to express my thoughts and emotions, as well as relax. I personally consider it difficult to describe the ways creative arts can aid personal development, which may be because creative arts exist outside of what is written or spoken. However, I realize the profound impact creative arts had on me and on the individuals I work with when we are truly invested in the process. Creativity and creative arts are at the foundation of who I am.

Professional Experience

Not only do I personally utilize creative arts, I also utilize creative arts when counseling and supervising. The use of creative arts in a professional setting began during the student-teaching experience near the end of my undergraduate studies in teaching. At this point, I noticed the power of creative arts exercises in the classroom, and once I became a counselor and then a supervisor, I realized how creativity provided more depth in the counseling and supervising process as well. During my doctoral internship, serving as both a counselor and a supervisor, I found that creativity allowed me to reach a different level than the spoken word alone allows, as creative exercises enable a person to explore concepts they may not be able to verbalize. The idea to conduct the current study emerged from my own experiences as a counselor, supervisee, and supervisor.

Throughout my career as a counselor and supervisor I have attended numerous conferences and listened to many presentations about various creative arts exercise, including sessions specifically about the use of creativity in supervision. I have completed coursework in quantitative and qualitative research methods and counselor supervision, and I have served as a

supervisor to over 20 supervisees. In addition, I have served as a teaching assistant for an internship course as well as supervised on-site groups of CITs at the CTC and another off-campus training site. My doctoral studies as well as my practical experience equipped me with the knowledge necessary to conduct the current study.

Study Participants

Purposeful sampling was used to select study participants in order to obtain an information-rich data source that would be able to capture the phenomenon in question (Patton, 2002). Research participants were Master's-level CITs fulfilling their requirements for clinical fieldwork in the CTC on the campus of a university in the southwestern region of the United States. All CITs in the CTC were required to participate in various experiences conducted in the CTC; however, they are not required to participate in research. The current study was introduced at the CTC's orientation for the fall 2012 semester. CITs volunteered to participate in the experience; they were not required to participate in the research. However, all of those who participated in this group supervision did agree to participate in the research, as well. Initially, six CITs volunteered to participate in the study; however, one participant withdrew. Therefore, data were collected from the five remaining CIT participants.

All five participants were completing an internship: one study participant was completing Internship 1 (second semester of fieldwork), and four study participant were completing Internship 2 (third semester of fieldwork). Three of the participants were male and two were female. Participants' ages (in years) ranged from mid-20s to early 60s. Four of the five participants were specializing in clinical mental health counseling, and the fifth was specializing in addictions. All participants were Caucasian, three self-identified as White, one as Hispanic,

and one as bi-ethnic Hispanic and White. Three of the study participants have Bachelor's degrees in psychology, one has a Bachelor's degree in religious studies, and the fifth has a Ph.D.

Setting

The site of the research was the Counseling and Training Clinic (CTC) on the campus of a university located in the southwestern region of the United States. The CTC is maintained within the Counseling and Educational Psychology Department and is supervised by a departmental faculty coordinator, a doctoral student director, and additional doctoral students working under the director to assist with individual supervision. At the time of study, there were approximately 17 CITs providing counseling services and five doctoral students in addition to the director. All doctoral student supervisors at the CTC were supervised by Counseling and Educational Psychology Department faculty.

The CTC's hours of operation were between 10:00am and 8:00 pm, on Tuesday and Thursday. Clients are seen at the clinic beginning at 12:00pm. The supervision group met in a meeting room in the CTC beginning at 10:30 on Tuesdays. Duration of group supervision was approximately one hour, allowing for 30 minutes between the close of the group for preparing for clients, cleaning up the room as needed, and journaling. The meeting room used for the group supervision was equipped with tables and chairs. Each morning before group meetings, I arranged the room to meet the needs of the particular creative arts activity that would be completed that day. I also provided the materials needed to complete each exercise.

Group Supervision Process

This creative arts supervision group met weekly for ten weeks. Each week a different creative arts activity was used (see appendix F). Each session lasted approximately one hour. The

group met at 10:30 am, prior to the beginning of the clinic hours. At the beginning of each meeting the CITs were introduced to the activity, if no preparation had been required on their part. Two activities (music and photos) needed prior preparation on the part of the CITs. Participants then engaged in the creative activity. Once CITs completed the creative activity, I facilitated group discussion around the activity. CITs were asked to talk about their creation and their reactions to the process, but were not required to do so. CITs were then asked to respond to prompts (see appendix E) in their participant journals after each group meeting. Participants completed prompts after completion of the group and returned their journals to me to be locked in a secure filing cabinet specifically designated for this activity. There was no time limit placed on participants for journal completion; however, CITs were required to return journals before the end of the day.

Data Collection

Data was collected throughout the study using a variety of sources. Data sources include participant journals, field notes and researcher observations, photographs of product created in supervision group, individual interview, and focus group. Participants maintained a journal with responses to prompts provided at the end of each supervision group. Photographs were made of participants' artwork where appropriate. Throughout the process, I maintained field notes and kept a reflective journal of my observations and reactions. In addition, individual interviews with all participants were conducted at the end of the group supervision process, followed by a focus group session.

Participant Journals

As Patton (2002) stated, “Initially, all our understanding comes from sensory experiences of a phenomena, but the experience must be described, explicated, and interpreted” (p. 106). In order to assist participants in capturing their own experiences of each supervision group, journals that contained three prompts to be used each week were provided. I gave each CIT a composition book to be used as their participant journal. Inside each journal cover were journal prompts. The prompts were: (1) My experience of today’s creative arts group supervision, (2) What I took away from today’s creative arts group supervision about my client(s), and (3) How I see the impact of today's group supervision on me as a counselor. Journal writing took place 15 to 20 minutes immediately following the supervision group. Participants labeled their journals using a unique word, phrase, or image. To maintain confidentiality, journals were kept in a locked cabinet in the CTC to ensure information security. Once the supervision group was complete journals were passed out to participants. Participants were asked to complete the journal within that day. When participants completed the journal prompts they returned the journals to myself, and they were put back into the locked filing cabinet. This filing cabinet remained locked and was not accessible by other students in the CTC.

Photographs

Photographs were taken to capture the visual product created upon completion of each supervision group. Patton (2002) stated that in instances where a physical environment offers more than a literal description, photographs can be used to provide detailed description of experiences. These photographs will help in offering an overall rich understanding of the experiences of the supervisees as well as help understanding perceptions of CITs for various

activities. Prior to taking pictures, I obtained each participant's permission. Photographs captured the product (e.g., painting, sculpture, drawing) created during the supervised group and any identifying information was removed. Photographs were used to enhance the conceptualization of themes as well as aid in the process of my own reflection of the supervision group.

Observations and Field Notes

Concluding each group meeting, I recorded details about the meeting and the overall experience. Because people tend to alter their behavior when they are aware of the fact that they are observed, I conducted what Patton (2002) refers to as “unobtrusive observations” (p. 291) by taking notes immediately following the group meeting and occasionally making quick notes during the group session. Notes included the process followed during the group session as well as my own thoughts, reactions, and observations. These observations documented participants' interactions and language, nonverbal communication, symbolic space, unplanned activities, and also things that did not happen, as discussed by Patton (2002). Recording descriptive details of planned and unplanned events helped data collection in terms of recalling and reflecting on the events that occurred during group supervision.

Individual Interviews

Semi-structured individual interviews were used to collect data once the last supervised group was complete. Interview times were scheduled according to convenience for both the study participants and myself. Interviews were audiotaped and transcribed for data analysis purposes. Pseudonyms, chosen by the participants, were used to identify each participant. Each interview lasted from 30 minutes to an hour, and took place in the director's office at the CTC. A semi-structured interview guide was used to ensure consistency across interviews while allowing

for follow-up questions as appropriate (Appendix G). Interview questions were carefully developed to delve into participants' perspectives about the issue being investigated. However, the structure of the interviews was flexible to allow new questions to probe emergent ideas.

Focus Group

A focus group was conducted after all participant interviews were complete. The benefit of a focus group session was to allow participants to hear other group members' responses and "make additional comments beyond their original responses as they hear what other people have to say" (Patton, 2002, p. 386). During this group, I asked questions that emerged during initial data analysis of participants' journals and individual interviews. The focus group lasted approximately two hours and was also audiotaped and transcribed. Pseudonyms, as chosen by the participants, were used to identify each participant in the focus group transcription. I encouraged participants to agree, disagree, or elaborate on any ideas they thought warranted further discussion because focus groups are not designed to force participants to reach a particular conclusion. The ultimate purpose of a focus group was to get "high-quality data in a social context where people can consider their own views in the context of the views of others" (Patton, 2002, p. 386).

Data Transcription Methods

Once data collection was complete, all audiotaped interviews and the focus group session were transcribed "as a part of data management and preparations" (Patton, 2002, p. 441). Patton (2002) suggested that the process of transcribing one's own data "provides an opportunity to get emerged in the data" (p. 441). I transcribed all individual interviews and the focus group by listening to the digital recordings, repeated replaying and slowing the audiotapes, as well as

rereading while listening to final transcriptions. This was all to insure accuracy of information as well as an opportunity to immerse myself in the data. The process of careful transcription and immersion in the data aided in my conceptualization of potential themes and understanding of what the participants were saying.

Member Checks

Once individual interviews and the focus group were transcribed, I contacted each participant via e-mail to review the transcript of their responses. Transcripts were emailed as they became available. Each participant had the opportunity to evaluate transcripts for accuracy. This verification process ensured credibility of the study findings (Creswell, 1998).

Data Analysis

Stages of data analysis, using grounded theory methods, were conducted to organize and understand participants' experiences. Layers of data analysis were utilized including initial coding, line-by-line, word-by-word, and focused coding. Extensive data organization was utilized to maintain an accurate audit trail. I conducted initial coding upon completion of the individual interviews and prior to the focus group session using the participants' journals. I also used memo writing to gather common elements among individual interview recordings. This was done in order to formulate questions for the focus group. As I read each journal entry and listened to each individual interview audio recording I noted any commonalities among participants. I was able to identify several recurrent statements or topics. Findings from this initial review of data guided the development of the questions to ask and guided the focus group discussion. Once the focus group session was complete and all data was transcribed, I revisited participants' journals and interview transcripts.

Initial Coding

Once the transcription process was complete, I conducted initial coding, as the first major thread of analysis. During this process, I remained open, moved quickly through data, focused on defining actions through gerunds, compared data with other data, and examined participants' responses (Charmaz, 2006). I used the margins of the transcripts to take additional notes. Coding included line-by-line and *in vivo codes*, when appropriate, to capture meaning. Various colored pens were used to distinguish common elements. For example, when participants discussed awareness I would make note of the comment in red, and when clients were mentioned I used green.

Word-by-word or phrase-by-phrase, coding was used to break down data to the smallest units. Word-by-word analysis forces you to attend to the images and meanings (Charmaz, 2006). With this, words and short phrases were chosen due to their significance in the contexts of the transcripts. These words were then transferred to note cards and organized into like units. This extensive process began by taking the word units and clumping like words, grouping like words into progressively larger units. Once units were constructed they were given names. These names and key words were compared and reevaluated. Comparative methods were used to evaluate word-by-word to line-by-line data in order to reconstruct meaning and develop themes. Units of data were carefully compared, examined, and reexamined during the process of initial coding.

Focused Coding

The second major thread of analysis, focused coding, began by sifting earlier codes from the large amount of data and making decisions about things that made more sense (Charmaz, 2006). The units of data that were organized and scrutinized in initial coding were then used to

construct a larger understanding of the data. Where initial coding broke data down, focused coding reconstructed the data. As a result of initial coding I had specific labeled codes. First, I attempted to determine the adequacy of these codes (2006) by examining word units and its origin in the data. In this process I was able to accept, reject, or reevaluate initial codes. One particular example was the code ‘unfolding’, where in early coding procedures this code seemed to be significant, after more in-depth examination this code was not as meaningful. Charmaz (2006) warned that coding is not a truly linear process; the process of reconstructing data in this process forced me to reexamine initially understood themes. Therefore, during initial coding I was forced to revisit and reevaluate initial coding units. Once focused codes were evaluated and checked for accuracy, descriptive units of data were selected to best illustrate said code, or theme.

Data Organization

Data organization was imperative, keeping raw data connected to the original source as well as making thematic connections as neat as possible. I used an audit trail to maintain connection of original data to identified themes. Electronic versions of transcripts were stored on my personal computer; field notes, notes taken during observations, and participant journals were kept separate from data I actively worked on for analysis. Printed versions of each transcript and copies of participant journals were used for analysis. For word-by-word analysis, small units of data were rewritten on index cards. The index cards were connected to the data source using a coding system including a J for journal or FG for focus group, page number, and questions number, such as Jp2q3. This specific code would indicate the word or phrase came from page one of a Journal and that the statement was in response to the third question. This code was then

highlighted to indicate the individual that provided said data. Each participant was designated a specific color. This code allowed for the ease of connecting small units (words and lines) to original data source. I kept notes and memos of what I did along the way as well as photographed my process at key phases.

Trustworthiness

Trustworthiness can be illustrated through a researcher's use of multiple data sources, evidence of extensive engagement with participants and data, consulting with peers, supervisors, and participants about data collected, and finding connections between original data sources and identified themes (Patton, 2002). These strategies all contribute to the examination of patterns and the reduction of researcher bias. In this study I used multiple sources of data such as journals, individual interviews, and focus group transcripts, as well as art data through photographs, researcher observation, and researcher journaling. During the group supervision protocol I discussed various concerns and thoughts related to the group supervision process with my supervisor. During the analysis of data I consulted with a peer reviewer and my supervisor. Data organization, including an extensive audit trail, was used in order to maintain trustworthiness with regards to thematic finding. Various measures taken to insure trustworthiness are discussed below.

Prolonged and Persistent Engagement

I was present at the study site and engaged with study participants throughout the research process, serving as supervisor at the CTC, group supervisor, and researcher. During the supervised group sessions, I refrained from reading journals due to the potential influence in the delivery of group supervision. However, during these sessions, I kept a personal research journal

to reflect on group processes and events as well as to identify any points to discuss with my supervisor. At the end of the 10 weeks of group supervision, I began to read and become immersed in the data created via reading journal entries and noting reactions and potential commonalities or themes. Prolonged engagement with data may also be seen through transcription of the individual interviews and focus group by repetitive reading and re-reading, coding, and reflecting. My extensive connections to the study participants and the data aided validity of the findings in the current study.

Triangulation

Data were collected from multiple sources. Each week, participants provided feedback via journals; data was also collected from participants using individual interviews and a focus group session. Multiple data collection modalities were utilized to triangulate data: journals, photographs, field notes, individual interview transcripts, and the focus group session transcript. Triangulation sheds light on patterns and themes stemming across the data sources (Creswell, 1998).

Debriefing and Peer Review

Upon completion of the supervision groups, individual interviews, and the focus group, I debriefed my experiences, reactions, and impressions of each experience with my supervisor. In addition, I utilized a peer reviewer who examined the data and reflected on categories created in word-by-word analysis. These processes provided outsider perspectives throughout the process of the supervision group and study.

CHAPTER 4: RESULTS

The purpose of this study was to examine how CITs perceive the use of creative arts methods in group supervision and how they describe its perceived effects. Participant journals, interviews, and focus group were used to capture the experience and perceived effects throughout the process of the study. Eight overarching themes were identified using the data collected from participants over the course of ten supervision groups, individual interviews, and one focus group. These included: (1) positive experience, (2) balance with traditional supervision, (3) creating an environment, (4) engaging in a creative process, (5) perceptions of impact, (6) awareness, (7) importance of the group, and (8) techniques. The first theme, positive experience, includes a sub-theme, relaxation. The theme entitled *engaging in a process* includes authentic self and being present as subthemes. The sixth theme, awareness, encapsulates both awareness of themselves and awareness of clients.

Positive Experience

Participants talked about their reactions to the experience of the supervision group, both during the group itself via group discussion and journals, as well as in interviews and the focus group. As Talia said, the supervision group was generally viewed as “a positive experience.” Manu indicated, “I have to say that these group sessions have been very productive and helpful.” Rachel said, “I really enjoyed it. It was my favorite thing out of the program.” Columbus indicated, “It was exhilarating . . . really enjoyable . . . it became something that I quickly began to look forward to every week.” When asked about the importance of enjoying supervision, Talia said:

I think enjoying it allows you to get the maximum benefit out of it. If it's something you are not looking forward to or that you are not fully invested in, the rewards that you get out of it isn't going to be nearly what it could be. For my development as a counselor, the fact that I did enjoy it and the fact that I did go in there with no reserve allowed me to really get in there and take what there was to take from it.

Participants indicated that they liked starting the day and week with this supervision group. Michael said, "It's a perfect way to start my week at the clinic. The activities help to center and clarify me and I feel like I am a more confident counselor because of them."

Expressing a similar idea, Talia stated, "It's nice being able to explore our thoughts and feelings at the beginning of the day because I personally feel more centered and grounded for the rest of the day." Michael noted "It made my day at the facility better." According to Rachel,

. . . it helped because it started the day and each time it gave me a little more insight into how I was as a counselor and what different techniques I could use with my client. So, it made me feel a little more prepared for the day.

Manu stated, "For me it was definitely that time to just go in there and . . . get in touch with your own self . . . and relax a little bit and de-stressed a little bit . . . prepared me for the day."

Columbus also talked about how the group helped his attitude towards the day ahead of him with clients, stating

Here it was not a matter of particular techniques or activities but rather a matter of attitude. I think that it made us feel empowered to start the day like we could make a difference or we were doing something that mattered and it gave us encouragement.

Relaxation

Participants describe an element of relaxation associated with the experience. Manu stated, “I think this type of supervision helps everybody relax . . . takes the edge off and allows everybody to communicate more openly.” He indicated that “doing the actual working with the stuff was actually really relaxing . . . it put me in a different frame of mind.”

Talia also talked about being relaxed in the group and being “able to . . . turn your mind off for a minute of the other million things you’ve got going on.”

Balance with Traditional Supervision

Participants discussed the differences between this supervision experience and traditional supervision. As they contrasted their supervision experiences, none compared it with group supervision classes in which they were enrolled, but rather with individual supervision. They expressed how these two methods during the semester balanced each other out. Michael stated,

It is so different from traditional client oriented supervision... I am sold on the creative arts supervision. It’s not like ‘oh it’s fun to go and mess around with art stuff,’ and there is an element of play to it and that’s really cool. For me it was the process and what happened during the process, building me up as a person.

Columbus discussed how this process was different than traditional supervision for him, “the opposite feeling of being in for an hour with a supervisor, and being sort of on a carpet, it balanced it out well.” He went on to say:

I think this is really a very good balancing part to the other supervision where sometimes I feel like I’m either at confession or I’m making an oral defense. Those are stressful

things and I agree with Michael you can show your creativity or what I call my silly side and it's accepted.

CITs stated their belief that the ideal experience would include both traditional and creative elements in supervision. Michael stated, "Ideally there would be a balance. That's why there was a good balance of that Tuesday group and then individual supervision as we all got it."

Creating an Environment

The notion that this particular group supervision, using creative arts methods, established a particular environment, specially a safe environment, was a repeated theme for participants. In fact, participants described this environment as a *safety zone*, referring to the atmosphere created by the process of using creative arts. In order to understand the importance of this idea, it is critical to understand the challenges experienced by participants as they moved through their practicum/internship experiences. Participants described a level of discomfort or stress that comes from being a CIT. Michael said, "I feel like I'm surviving sometimes. It's so undignified." Columbus expressed a similar idea: "I wonder if we all felt that we were undergoing some sort of crisis in our education, try to get through this and adapt to the clinic and everything else." Another challenge is the perceived pressures to not make mistakes, as described by Rachel:

When we are with our clients I always feel pressured to be the perfect counselor or in my classes I always feel like I have to be perfect there . . . I could not be 100% myself because I felt that I had to be perfect.

Participants discussed how they were able to become okay with making mistakes in the group. According to Michael, "The group was like the opportunity to fumble, it was the

opportunity to say, ‘yeah, I don’t really know’ and get comfortable with that. It was safe, it was low key.” Rachel described it thusly:

It was easier to be myself, there’s no pressure . . . I felt like it was a safe zone, I wasn’t ever embarrassed of anything that I did. I was comfortable showing what I worked on. I felt like it was really safe to talk and do the projects or the art.

The structure of the group may have provided the foundation for the group being experienced as a safety zone. According to Michael,

It was like that safety zone . . . we were strongly encouraged to give feedback, but if we just wanted to sit with a piece we could. I think that was what helped developed that safe space. That’s the power and the beauty, and also the scary part about art is that sometimes art can be really troubling. Or sometimes, you don’t know what to make of it; I don’t really know what to say. So knowing that you are not necessarily going to have to give feedback, not only is it safe for you as the artist, but it’s safe for you as the spectator. So I think that was kind of an important part of it. You don’t have to force the rule; you don’t have to make people give feedback, because if you create a safe place people will be compelled to give feedback.

In the perceived safety zone participants felt safe to be wrong, and through this they were able to gain confidence. Talia explained how taking the pressure off helped her to gain confidence in herself, she said:

I felt like it gave me more confidence as a counselor, and I felt like it was ok to be wrong sometimes or not have all the answers . . . I felt like the pressure to have it all figured out was alleviated a lot through the group. There was no pressure here, if you didn’t know, it

was ok, if somebody else didn't know, that was ok. For me that was important, I tend to put a lot of pressure on myself individually, so I felt a lot of relief from that.

Participants described the group experience as an enactment of the core conditions. "I didn't realize it at the time but now it seems to be clear to me that the group was an exercise in the core conditions" said Columbus. In this group participants felt as though they were able to experience different elements of the core conditions. Manu discussed unconditional positive regard:

. . . that was a term I had heard so many times . . . but here we saw it, in practice . . . I've heard it all along, I heard it in practicum, I've heard it in all these classes. I've heard it over and over again. But I didn't really, I couldn't really put my finger on it, what that really was, but I think this really helped me. And I don't think I'm there yet, but this helped me down that path.

Engaging in a Creative Process

Participants all noted a particular process that occurred during the supervision groups. They expressed that the experience was not about the art itself; rather, it was about the process of creating and discussing the creative art activities. This process allowed the CITs to become more aware of themselves and their emotions, allowed them to be fully present, and resulted in self-revelation and awareness that happened whether they intended it or not. Some participants noted the awareness as a result of a particular creative arts exercise, as indicated by Talia, who said:

This exercise allowed me to get more in touch with the emotions I feel with counseling my clients. I usually try to subdue that part and being about more logical perspectives. It was nice to really focus on the emotional aspects.

For others, the group supervision process as a whole seemed to spur the enhancement of awareness. For instance, Rachel indicated, “It really makes me try and dig deep down inside which is interesting and scary all at once.”

Similarly, Michael stated:

It was a therapeutic experience doing this artwork because it was individual to me. And it wasn't like I was painting great paintings or making great collages or being a great sculptor, it wasn't about the craft, it was about what I was bring to it, it was what I was taking away from it.

Manu talked about his experience of going with the process, indicating,

All the activities, even the ones that I saw were difficult for me when we were doing it, afterwards I thought ‘wow that was really interesting how I was able to just go with it and get some neat results out of it.’

Authentic Self

The process that occurred in the creative arts supervision group allowed the CITs to see their perceived authentic selves. The process of doing something, not knowing where it was going, and the resulting product, seemed to contribute to this revelation. Manu reflected on the process and said:

Several times I would start and not really know where I was going, but then by the time that I knew it I was already heading one direction. It was really what I was feeling at that time . . . it took away that apprehension, and it allowed me to just go with the process and not worry about how I got there, just kinda go with it. At the end it was like ‘wow that is

what I was thinking, that is where I was going' so it was able to flow that way a little easier.

Manu also described how his feelings and thoughts came out in the group, even when he did not completely intend for them to do so. After sometime the worry associated with showing himself to the group diminished. He continued:

The first couple of times, right when we were getting done and finishing our little, whatever it was we were working on, I was like crap I want to change that, 'do I really want that out there' or 'do I want to change it up' but after a while I was like 'ah, ok' because I saw that there wasn't any, like Columbus was saying, like we've all said so far there was no, I didn't care anymore.

Participants talked about the ability to be open in the group. Manu was able to describe this process particularly well. He discussed how this type of supervision allowed him to open up:

You lose track of the fact that there are other people, for that moment when you are working and by the time you are done you are anxious to share what you've done, so that kind of fuels that openness and that ability to be able to share things like that. Where in other supervisions, we just sit there and hear people but, should I say something, should I not say something? What will they think if I say it out loud? We all might be thinking it but this way it didn't feel like that.

Michael also shared his experience of the process of using the creative arts in group supervision:

I'm just so self-conscious, so fearful of being completely off that I'll hold back my development as a counselor. But the great thing about the art stuff is that you really can't

hold back, your personality whether you wanted to or not. And I'm surprised, I'm trying to think if it ever got really emotional, I don't think it ever did, but I'm surprised that it didn't, because you are going to come out whether you want to or not in what you are doing.

Rachel, in referring to prior group supervision experience, indicated, "I could not get into it and my guard was constantly up and I felt like that held me back from the group. With this one, I guess your guard could be up, but it doesn't matter."

Participants discussed how they were unable to avoid the process that unfolded. Columbus explained his feelings about going into the group with an understanding of this process:

I think I was nervous even up to the end because there is no running away because once you're in there you got to do something, and what comes, comes. And I think I feel that way a lot of times in the regular sessions too. 'Oh, I wish I wasn't here' or 'I'm going to mess this up' or 'this is beyond my talents' or whatever 'but I'm here, there is no running away, I've got to do it' so at least I start the day with an experience where I might have had that feeling but I worked through it and it was ok so it sets a precedence.

Being Present

Participants also discussed the experience of being present and the value associated with being so. Manu stated "That was one of the things that I took away was what it meant to be present with a client". Michael also described learning the value of being present, and said:

Not only did I come away with greater self-understanding but I came away with the idea that I can be effective, I don't have to know everything about myself, just be present . . .

I'll do myself a disservice, or I'll rob myself of something if I don't just be present with a client.

Talia connected this process to mindfulness, and indicated:

What we did in there, just the process of it, was sort of a mindfulness process in and of itself . . . I was thinking 'ah, that's good.' I felt the same way. It really wasn't about the end product; it was about the process of it all.

Perceptions of Impact

Participants all endorsed the notion that the experience was impactful, and described how it impacted them. Michael said in his final journal entry, "The whole process was thoroughly impactful. I believe in the power of creative expression to inspire, empower and promote change." He explained in the focus group how the group helped him in the process of becoming a counselor and gaining confidence in what he is doing in the room:

All I really have to bring to that is who I am as a person, and it's the same thing, who I am as a person is who I am as a counselor . . . if I don't build myself up as a person I'm not going to have anything to offer those clients. So I guess just for me it's important to say 'yeah, it helped me to manage my stress and a lot of fun' but it was more than that too . . . for this clinician it was crucial.

Michael also gained the awareness of himself as an instrument in the counseling relationship, and said:

I came away with . . . 'wow, I have something to offer. I'm a unique person.' And that confidence and that kind of self-ownership, that's what I think, translated into the room and I think that's what made me a stronger counselor.

Columbus talked about realizing there is so much more to the therapeutic relationship than talking, and said:

When we are with our clients sometimes just to have a shared moment, mutual validation, and that could mean so much and perhaps more than any discussion that took place over the hour and as therapists there are so many levels of communication and things we can do.

Columbus also talked about what the group did for him in connection to the profession, his professional identity, and gaining confidence as a counselor:

I think that it enhanced my confidence, my experience, and my appreciation for potentialities, opened up vistas of things I would like to try and the possibilities. I think it put me in a good frame of mind as far as taking developmental approach towards the career and that there are so many good, wonderful, and exciting places left to go beyond graduation . . . Grounding me as a counselor, giving me a professional identity, because by affirming a part of me, my imagination, my creativity, which before maybe had not been, I did not feel had been valued. So suddenly it validated those parts of me so I felt more in tune or more a part of the profession . . . So it did help to affirm my place in the profession and it served to enhance my professional identity.

In the focus group, Talia discussed being brave as an impact of the experience, and said, “Being brave, being brave about revealing to someone else about who we are, being brave enough to accept what comes back after doing that, but also being brave enough to utilize it with other people.” Manu continued Talia’s thought, and added, “And being brave enough to speak up and say something about something that you are struggling with.”

Awareness

Participants all noted greater awareness of themselves and their clients as the group supervision progressed. Self-awareness and client awareness were both considered important points of growth by participants. As Rachel noted in her journal, “I feel like every group we have done so far has made me learn more about myself and my clients.” This awareness came from being able to look at things in a different way. Talia stated:

There was never any ‘what it should and shouldn’t be.’ So it opened, sort of broadened my mind and that allowed me to view the same things that I had been viewing in a different way, through a different lens.

Self-awareness

The experience of becoming increasingly self-aware was one noted by all participants. Sometimes the awareness had to do with an opportunity or need for growth, such as that indicated by Talia when she said, “I am learning every day more about myself, as well as other members of my group. Today I was more aware of my need to be free and independent”. Other times it had to do with becoming aware of common themes or patterns over time. Rachel said:

I think for me my self-awareness grew as we went through the project, because I saw a common theme for each of my projects. I always had a person or an animal with me, so I would notice little things like that as we went through the project. There was always something that I brought from myself in that project, even if I was talking about my client. There was still something about me in it.

Columbus also noted increasing self-awareness, and described it as having things come to his conscious awareness, things that he may not have examined. He stated:

I don't think I was ever really surprised or shocked at what I did here, what I learned about myself, but it certainly helped me become aware of things that were maybe lurking in the back of my mind and brought it to the forefront, that helped a lot.

While each participant described the experience of learning more about himself or herself in the process of the group supervision, Michael captured the concept of gaining self-awareness in detail:

I feel like what it did most strongly was it gave me a better handle on who I was, not just who I was in general, but also who I was as a counselor and that, that is what translated to me being better in the room. Because I did get, this semester, exponentially better in the room. Where it seemed to happen rather quickly, and it seemed to be a number of factors not just the group supervision, but I think it definitely played a part in me. Just being able to take ownership of who I was and kind of see value in the stuff that I was doing because your personality invariably comes out when you do the art stuff. It's sort of like it is just there and it's like whatever it is, and it was really cool to see peoples' inner truths come out in the work they did. And some of it was really inspiring, a hand full were kind of disturbing, mine probably fell somewhere in the middle. That's the only way I can put it, is that peoples' truths came out. My truth came out in the work I did, and it was good to see it and I wasn't afraid of it, and I was kind of proud of it. I feel like my personality in various ways just came out in the different activities we did, and I liked what I saw and I liked who I was, so that was good, that was cool.

CITs also gained awareness of themselves and their roles in the counseling relationship. Manu realized his limitations with one particular couple, and indicated:

When we did the music . . . one particular client that I spoke of that day, up until that point I was feeling kind of frustrated with, I guess, because it seemed to be that our sessions were just going around and around in circles. I was getting frustrated because I could see that they were getting worse. They were arguing more and more, and we had talked about what we could do. We talked about them and I presented those songs, when I chose the song I chose I kind of realized that we can do whatever we can do, we can do the best that we think we can for them, but it's going to be ultimately up to them to take the steps and begin again . . . They are both going to have to do the dance together now for it to be beneficial for them. I said 'you know what, we can do whatever we can, the co-counselor and I, but ultimately it will be them.' So that kind of helped.

Client Awareness

For these participants, gaining a better understanding of their clients was an important part of the group supervision. In gaining deeper understanding of their clients, participants were able to see their clients in a different way. For instance, Talia indicated, "I got a better understanding of my client through this process. I realized I saw her as two halves of a whole, broken inside. I see so much sadness, but so much strength."

Rachel described it best when she said:

It makes you think about the client in a whole new way or a whole different way you can see it. So, I think this type of supervision makes you think a lot more about different perspectives and things that you didn't realize that were going on inside because you had no words for them. It helped putting it out there in a different form.

Michael noted that seeing the client in a different way allowed him to be “just more empathic in session.”

Importance of the Group

Participants discussed the importance of the connections created in the group and how they were able to help one another. Michael stated, “I enjoyed the camaraderie of the group, and it was sort of like a perfect storm in that sense.” “Cohesiveness among the group continues to grow with every meeting,” stated Columbus in his participant journal. The connection with the group members was a recurring concept throughout the data. Columbus talked about how he was able to feel comfortable with the people in the group, and said:

There was a lot of self-disclosure and I think that helped, whether it normalized and made us feel more normal or illustrated how off the wall we were, either way it was interesting, and it was fun. And we had a lot of trust in one another so we were able to self-disclose comfortably. If we had any trepidation at the beginning I would think that by the third session it was gone, and seemed to be speaking very freely.

Similarly, Talia indicated how the group working together added to the benefit of the experience when she said:

In this particular case I think we were all able to feed and grow off of one another based on the fact that we were able to be so open and honest with our experience. I think had anyone pulled back or not have been participatory, I think the group would have read that and I’m not sure what the impact of that would have been, I think that each individual still would have gotten a positive experience. I think that group experience itself would have been affected. Because we were all willing to go there with each other . . . it really

positively affected us exponentially; we got more out of it because we put so much into it.

The participants were able to provide feedback to one another. Talia said, “I think that processing helped me because I got to see different people’s perspective.” Rachel talked about how the differences among the group members helped her gain new perspectives when she said,

It showed me how different, each person is a different counselor and we are going to see things differently. So, being able to share what I made . . . and hearing other people’s perspective helped a lot because I was able to go into my sessions with a new perspective or a new way to look at it.

Participants were able to use the group to provide clarity in understanding what was happening and what they were communicating in the group. Talia explained,

There was a time or two where I didn’t know what I was coming up with either, but then hearing everyone else’s perspective about it made me look at it in a different way too, and I thought that was really helpful.

Participants began to trust one another and internalize the feedback. Manu described what made the group powerful for him when he said,

Hearing that stuff from people I respect, for people who I have worked with and from people who have been there with me. Hearing stuff like that can’t help but help somebody. I think when we share stuff like that with each other, I think that’s one reason why the group came together the way that it did, not only were we not afraid to put ourselves out there but we also weren’t afraid to share with each other what we thought. I think that’s what made this thing such a powerful experience for me.

For the participants, the group was essential to the experience that was created. Michael explained:

I've thought about what that group might have been like had I not felt safe with everybody in it. But I think that the group is essential to the work. I don't think that art really exists unless you have somebody to see it and share it with. It's funny, out of this group I've been inspired in my own life, I like to write, I don't really like doing other types of art but I've always loved to write since I was a little kid, and I've always done it on and off. I have a friend . . . who also likes to write and we've struck up this friendship and by having a group of two we're able to, not only hold each other accountable and get something to each other every week, but you've got an audience, and I think you need the audience to bring the work to life . . . I didn't know what I was doing, what I had done a lot of the time. The group really shed light on that and gave a lot of insight, and helped me come away with something. Without the group a lot of times that would have been meaningless, I would have been just fucking around with paint for an hour. Y'all gave me, sometimes I knew what I was doing, but y'all really gave it, we breathe life into the work.

Participants believed this experience united them in the process of becoming clinicians. Columbus said, "You are so transparent out there in the fish bowl. And so for once we are all in the same fish bowl and swimming happily." Participants identified that the group of individuals present in the group supervision provided an audience for the work they created that helped to interpret what they had created, as well as served as a support systems and offered a sense of community.

Techniques

Participants were able to experience techniques first hand, and CITs discussed being able to put techniques in their toolboxes. Columbus talked about not using the activities, but filing them away for later:

At this point I never really used the exercises but I think we all filed them away in our brains so that some time down the line when the occasion arises we will probably draw on some of that and I get the feeling that every one of us in the group will use at least two of the techniques some time or other during the course of our careers.

Talia talked about the potential to apply what she had done, and said:

It gave me a whole lot of ideas of what I could use with clients, when we talked about ‘are there clients that you would use this with, why or why not’ and I think that was really helpful because you get to take what you have done and apply it.

Others discussed being able to use some creative arts interventions with clients. Rachel said, “I’ve used it with one of my clients here. We did a time line together. It was cool.” Manu talked about the experience of using one of the activities with a client. He indicated:

It made me be able to take that step to try those things. Because before I might have been more . . . reserved to try those things, I would have been like ‘they might think this is stupid, the client might think this is stupid.’ As a novice counselor, that always goes through the back of my head. I might do some technique and there’s this guy that’s having a hard time and I’m going to do something like that and are they going to think it’s stupid, and I would be afraid to do it. But even today I had a session and we did, it just happened, she started talking about writing and journaling and I said ‘well ok I’m

going to try this' and I did the found poems, and it was amazing. I would have never done that before, I didn't even know about that before but even if I did know it, a lot of stuff I learned and I've seen but I didn't feel strong enough to try it, you know what I am saying, but because of this group it happened, you know and it happened today. I was like 'wow . . . that was really cool how that whole thing happened like that' I don't know, it was neat . . . it made me brave enough to try stuff now, if that makes any sense, because I saw what it did for me.

CHAPTER 5: DISCUSSION

This chapter includes a discussion of the findings in this study. I provide an overview of the findings and describe how the findings relate to existing literature. I discuss initial thoughts about an emerging theory of creative arts in group supervision of counselors in training. Limitations to this study, implications for practice, and recommendations for future research are also discussed.

Overview of Findings

In this research I examined the experiences of CITs participating in group supervision using creative arts methods. I was interested in CITs' experience and perceived effect of utilizing these methods in supervision. Five CITs participated in the group supervision over a period of ten weeks. Weekly participant journals, individual interviews, and a focus group were used to collect data. Details of these methods are presented in chapter three, thick description of finding is provided in chapter four. CITs described the experience of using creative arts in group supervision, a particular process that emerged, and their perceptions of how this experience impacted them. Eight distinct themes emerged: (1) positive experience, (2) balance with traditional supervision, (3) creating an environment, (4) engaging in a creative process, (5) perceptions of impact, (6) awareness, (7) importance of the group, and (8) techniques.

CITs described their experience of participating in group supervision using creative arts methods. They explained that this experience was positive experience. They began looking forward to group meeting each week. One participant explained that enjoying the group allowed them to gain the maximum benefit and made their day at the CTC better. The group supervision was conducted at the beginning of the day, on the first day that the CTC was open for the week.

Participants described how this experience was a beneficial way to begin their time at the clinic. Relaxation was also a component of the group supervision experience. Participants identified that the group helped them relax, get into a different frame of mind, and prepare for the day.

Participants discussed the creative arts group supervision in comparison to their traditional individual supervision experience. They identified an element of balance that was created with the presence of both the creative group and individual supervision in their internship. The group supervision was an opportunity to examine themselves and individual supervision served as a means to address specific concerns related to their clients.

Participants described the creation of a particular environment in group as a safety zone. In this created environment they were able to overcome some of their perceived challenges of being a CIT. These perceived challenges often got in the way of the counselor participating fully in the supervision experience. CITs believed this group was an opportunity to explore ideas, be wrong, and not be judged or criticized. They were able to open up and let go of fears of not being the perfect counselor. According to one CIT, this environment may have been a result of the way the group was facilitated. Participants discussed the core conditions and how they may have been enacted in the group. They were able to experience these conditions, such as unconditional positive regard, and able to experience such conditions first hand.

The CITs described a specific process that occurred in doing these art activities in group supervision. This process allowed them to explore their perceived authentic selves and be present in the experience. Through this process, they were also able to become more in touch with their emotions and explore parts of their selves that they may not have been aware of prior to the group. Participants described how this experience was more about the process than the art itself.

The emergent process of participating in group supervision using creative arts yielded an authentic exploration of participants' thoughts, feelings, and emotions. In the process of doing the activities, CITs revealed themselves through the products they were creating. Participants described how this happened without their full intention or their understanding of what was happening until it happened. Over the course of the group supervision, CITs began to notice diminishment of the worry associated with revealing who they really were. CITs became more open and realized that their true selves would come out whether they wanted it or not. Participants perceived that they revealed their true selves because holding back in the group did not seem like an option.

Being present was also a major component of the process associated with using creative arts in group supervision. Participants were able to experience being present and understand firsthand the value of doing so as they participated in the creative arts activity. Participants connected the process of being present in group to mindfulness, as they were fully engaged in the activity. From their own experiences of being present in the group, participants identified the benefits of being present with clients in session.

Participants viewed the group supervision experience using creative arts as impactful. They began to believe in the use of creative arts as a means for inspiration and change. This experience aided in their understanding of themselves as individuals and as counselors, as well as of what they bring into the counseling relationship. Participants were able to connect to the profession, as the experience of creative arts was new to their understanding of what they could do in the counseling room.

CITs identified an increase in awareness as a result of the group. Their self-awareness and client-awareness was affected, allowing them to see both in a different way. Each CIT was able to gain an awareness of themselves through the activities that were done each week. This awareness came by participants identifying a common theme among their work over the group supervision experience. Participants found that even when that work was about their client, they arose somehow in the art they created. This awareness gave CITs a better understanding of who they were as a person and as a counselor. CITs also gained a greater awareness of their clients. They were able to explore their client in a different way and gain different perspectives. They were able to explore concepts about their clients that they may not have been able to verbalize.

Participants identified the importance the group played in the process of understanding what was created using the creative arts and growing from that experience. Camaraderie developed among the group members, there was a great deal of self-disclosure, and trust and support began to develop. According to participants, this disclosure helped them to normalize their feelings. They were able to grow from the interpersonal experiences. CITs used the group members as an audience and to gain a new perspective. They were able to gain even more awareness from the feedback the group provided. CITs expressed that without the group the creative arts experience would have been less meaningful.

Finally, CITs discussed the techniques from the group as something to add to their toolbox. Participants discussed how experiencing the activities gave them ideas as to how to work with clients in the future and what they could bring into sessions. While not all participants had used the activities, some CITs discussed the experience of applying techniques and how that emerged in session.

Relationship to Existing Literature

There are a few empirical studies that address creative or expressive arts in group supervision (Rossi, 2010; Sheflett, 2011). Several studies address one particular creative method and others use multiple methods in brief time spans (Gurffrida, et al., 2007; McNichols, 2010). This research examines supervisors' experience using a variety of methods over the course of ten weeks, one activity per week. Prior studies have found that counselors-in-training enjoy using creative art in supervision. This study also found that supervisees perceived this is experience as positive. There is also evidence in prior research that CITs become more self-aware and more aware of clients in the process of using these methods. Again, this research resulted in similar findings. However, there is little evidence of a rationale for this impact, particularly from the CITs point of view. This research presents clear rationale for the impact from the CITs point of view.

Positive Experience

Participants in this study expressed their feelings about the group supervision experienced. Overall, their feelings about the experience were positive. They liked the group, felt as though it was productive and helpful, and made them feel better about the day at the CTC. Sheflett (2011) and Rossi (2010) studies found similar reactions to creative arts in supervision by supervisees. Participants in both of these studies, as well as the current study, felt as though the creative arts process was exciting and unique. Enjoying group supervision utilizing creative arts is an undertone within the studies that address the topic; however, little research addresses enjoyment as significant factor. In this study, participants expressed that enjoying supervision

allowed them to gain a more significant benefit from the supervision. This component is also not discussed in literature.

Balance with Traditional Supervision

Participants discussed the balance of this supervision experience with their traditional supervision experience. Participants acknowledged that this supervision experience was different than what they were accustomed to doing with their individual supervisors. They identified this experience of group supervision as a means for working on themselves as much as they worked on concerns with clients. Pearson (2006) discussed the integration of theory-based supervision with role-based supervision as a means for addressing supervisee development and educational concerns, as well as insuring quality of care for clients. CITs in this study indicated that creative arts in group supervision allowed them to examine themselves, while the individual supervision allowed them to address specific client care needs. While Pearson (2006) discusses the integration of these two aspects of supervision, this research identified a way to separate such roles of supervision and meet the needs of CITs. Skovholt and Ronnestadt (1992) identified the therapeutic self to be a unique combination of professional and personal selves. The findings of the current research offer an understanding for addressing the personal and professional selves of the CIT.

Creating an Environment

Participants in this study expressed their feelings toward supervision and their experience of being in internship. CITs discussed their fears of being themselves and felt as though they had to be perfect as counselor. Rigid thoughts about the profession and practices in the counseling room are common to the development process for CITs. It is evident that the participants in this

study experienced typical stresses such as questioning self-concept (Auxier et al., 2003), rigidity (Skovholt & Ronnestad, 1992; Kindsvatter et al. 2008), and feeling incompetent (Howard et al., 2006). In participating in creative arts supervision group, CITs were able to move past this rigid thinking and self-doubt and feel safe. In this group, it was not possible to be right or wrong, given the nature of the creative arts exercises. Therefore, supervisees experienced giving and receiving feedback in a non-evaluative manner, allowing them to feel accepted and encouraged. In this study, CITs were able to let go of their anxiety and explore themselves and their clients within a group where they felt accepted. This is consistent with findings of Auxier et al. (2003), who noted that “When participants perceived external evaluation as validation of their impressions of themselves as counselors and persons, their anxiety diminished” (p.33). Carter et al. (2009) identified support and safety as a helpful event that happens in group supervision. In a similar vein, Furr and Carroll (2003) stated that CITs need a supportive environment where they engage in self-examination. Once CITs were able to accept the personal nature of the art exercise they were able to engage further in the experience. They felt like the group was a safe space to fumble and make mistakes.

Engaging in a Creative Process

CITs discussed the process of doing creative arts in group supervision. This process allowed CITs to examine their perceived authentic selves as well as experience being present. The process of doing art in therapy (Rogers, 1993; Gladding, 2011; Schuck & Wood, 2011) has been described in professional literature. The process experienced by the CITs relates to the concepts discussed by Schuck and Wood (2011), who addressed the use of creativity in supervision. Schuck and Wood (2011) described the creative process as going into an intuitive

state. In this intuitive state, individuals access the right brain and abandon less logical, analytical, and sequential ways of thinking. According to Schuck and Wood, CITs engaged in the creative process are able to abandon their apprehension and rigid concepts of supervision. The findings of the current research appear to support that assertion. Similarly, Rogers stated that when we use creativity in therapy, “we release the layers of inhibitions that have concerned our originality, discovering our uniqueness and special beauty. Like a spiral, the process plums the depths of our body, mind, emotions, and spirit to bring us to our center. This center is the core of our essence, our wellspring of creative vitality” (1993, p. 45).

More broadly, Rossi (2010) studied the process of art engagement in supervision. She identified a four-stage process: (1) initial reaction, (2) art engagement, (3) reflection, and (4) transformation. In the current research, a broad process such as this could not be identified in the findings. The process identified in this research addresses the inner process that occurs in the CIT and how the CIT is able to get past defenses to access a more authentic response.

Perceptions of Impact

CITs identified the group supervision experience of using creative arts as impactful. In this process, they gained awareness and confidence in themselves as counselors. They felt better about their work and their ability to be present with a client. Various authors have discussed the impact of the components of this study. The findings of the current study identified the personal, professional, and interpersonal growth of the participants as areas of impact. For these CITs, personal and professional growth were not inseparable. Their personal growth was viewed as connected to professional development and ability to be effective in the room with a client. In

addition, CITs attributed personal growth to this particular supervision they were experiencing. The findings of this study support in part previous research about group supervision.

For example, Starling & Baker (2000) noted that supervisees identified increased confidence and clear goals as a result of peer group supervision. Neswald-McCalip et al. (2003) found that the process of using creative arts helped supervisees grow personally, professionally, and interpersonally, and Rossi (2010) found that use of expressive arts in group supervision impacted supervisees personally and professionally.

Awareness

Participants expressed an increase in awareness of themselves and their clients through the group supervision utilizing creative arts. Awareness is a common theme in the literature for creative arts in group supervision. Gurffrida, et al. (2007), in their study of metaphor in clinical supervision, found that metaphoric activities generally either helped supervisees understand the process of becoming a counselor through self-understanding and awareness, or facilitated case conceptualization. Newsome et al. (2005) also identified awareness to be a result of using expressive arts in group supervision. The current study further confirms previous findings related to creative art in supervision.

Self-Awareness

Participants reported they increased their self-awareness by being able to look at themselves in new ways. In the counseling literature, the use of creative arts has been found to increase client self-awareness (Rogers, 1993). Increased self-awareness has also been a finding in studies related to creative arts in supervision. Newsome et al. (2005) explored the use of expressive arts in “group supervision to enhance awareness and foster cohesion” (p. 145). They

found that group supervision using creative arts activities could foster personal awareness. Furr and Carroll (2003) found that gaining personal awareness was important to CITs' development.

Client Awareness

CITs in this study also expressed greater awareness of their clients by being able to look at them in a different way. This is consistent with findings by Gurffrida, et al. (2007), who indicated that metaphor in supervision may facilitate students' case conceptualization skills. Sheflett (2011) found that CITs were able to convey cases with more clarity and generate a more holistic understanding as a result of utilizing creative arts in supervision. The results of this study support previous findings as well as provide CIT perceptions about how creative arts assisted them in increasing client awareness. CITs stated the creative arts activities helped them to see their clients in a new way. In seeing their clients in a different way, they were able get a better understanding of who the client is and what they are going through, as well as be more empathic in session.

Importance of the Group

Participants identified the importance of the group and connections among group members. They saw the group itself as important to their growth and development, both in terms of being able to look at themselves and being able to increase their perspective-taking. The connection participants discussed is consistent with the findings of Newsome et al. (2005). Those researchers noted that creative arts in group supervision fostered cohesion and helped the supervisor create an atmosphere where students are supported and can thrive (2005). Gladding (2011) identified connection and socialization as reasons for utilizing creative arts in counseling, and his statements in this regard were supported by the current study. More specifically,

Skovholt and Ronnestad (1992) found that interpersonal experiences influence professional development. Findings of this study concur with those of Skovholt and Ronnestad, as participants attributed at least some of their growth to their interpersonal experiences as group members. Carter et al. (2009) identified constructs of group supervision that supervisees perceived as helpful events, including supervisor impact and peer impact. As with the current study, participants in Carter et al.'s study identified the peer members to be a source of helpful impact.

Techniques

Participants experienced creative arts techniques they could use with clients. Some CITs talked about the potential of using such techniques, while others expressed actually using particular techniques with clients. The findings of this study support previous contentions and findings. Gladding (2011) identified the ability to conceptualize and recreate beneficial activities as a reason for using creative arts in counseling. Bratton, Ceballos, and Sheely (2008) stated that using expressive arts in group supervision provides supervisees with techniques they could use in counseling. Wilson & Ziomek (2013) found that once supervisees experience and become comfortable with creative arts they are then able to see the benefit and endorse the use of creative arts with clients.

Researcher Final Thoughts about Emerging Data

The purpose of this study was to examine how CITs perceive the use of creative arts methods in group supervision and how they describe its perceived effects. Prior research on this topic yielded broad concepts related to self-awareness, client conceptualization, and personal and professional development; thus, I anticipated hearing about self-awareness and client awareness,

and was not surprised by participants' views that the group contributed to their development as counselors. However, "grounded theorists evaluate the fit between their initial research interest and their emerging data. We do not force preconceived ideas and theories directly upon the data" (Charmaz, 2006, p. 17). The results of this research yielded eight distinct themes: (1) positive experience, (2) balance with traditional supervision, (3) creating an environment, (4) the process (5) perceptions of impact (6) awareness, (7) importance of the group, (8) techniques. Voices of the participants were analyzed, scrutinized, and compared to arrive at these themes. However, one theme seems to transcend the others in significantly understanding the effects of utilizing creative arts methods in group supervision. That theme is *engaging in a creative process*.

In an effort to move the professional research beyond the current broad description of themes and constructs into more in-depth construction of theory about what happens in group supervision using creative arts methods I have utilized *interpretive theorizing* (Charmaz, 2006). Charmaz (2006) views *theorizing* as a means to see possibilities, establish connections, and ask questions. Grounded theory research, particularly with a constructivist approach, is more than looking at the participants' views of the situation or phenomenon. Rather, it is a means to "reach down to fundamentals, up to abstractions, and probe into experiences" (2006, p. 135). In this vein, I propose the beginnings of an emerging theory about group supervision utilizing creative arts.

First, given the right conditions, CITs who participate in group supervision that utilize creative arts *do what they do*. They attend, they actively participate in the activities, share to the degree they are comfortable, and listen to each other. In order for that to happen, certain parameters must be in place for the well-being of group members, but an effectively-run

supervision group will likely have primarily participants who attend, actively participate, and otherwise behave as group members. The right conditions mean that the supervisor should have experience and comfort with creative arts activities, be able to take a non-evaluative stance, be able to provide appropriate safety, and be able to foster a sense of community and support.

Engaging in a Creative Process

By first understanding the process of what happened with participants, only then can the other themes be connected. Much like the construction of a home, each element and person plays an important role in the process. However, it is the contractor that orchestrates the construction of the home. *Engaging in a creative process* theme in this study can be thought of as a home contractor.

The process, in which participants described, is what gives shape to the results of this study. Participants experienced an openness that was perceived as unavoidable. In this supervision group, they were doing something, in the moment, being present with their thoughts and feelings. They were physically engaging themselves in the work, manipulating material, focusing on themselves, and lost track of the awareness of the people around them. They were able to bypass insecurities and defenses. CITs may have begun each week, at least in the beginning, with apprehension; however, over the course of each group meeting and over the ten weeks of supervision, they were able to let go of their fears and fully engage. Over time, CITs realized that openness was unavoidable. They were going to show the group who they were whether they wanted or intended to, or not. In realizing this, they accepted the process and became more comfortable. The unavoidability of the process seemed to be a key factor in outcomes or impact perceived by participants. The inevitability of revealing oneself, being able

to lose some of their self-consciousness as they worked on a project, and having others also reveal themselves appeared to contribute to participants' ability to more fully examine their professional selves as well as explore concepts related to their clients.

Limitations of the Study

As with any research, there are several limitations to the current study. The first limitation that exists is associated the sample of participants used in this study. CITs from only one university clinic participated in the study. This limits the range of CIT experiences. Participants in this study were aware of the observations being made by me in the group. I worked closely with these individuals and became fond of them throughout the experience; therefore, it is possible the responses and actions by each participant, as well as my responses to them, were influenced by these two factors.

The emotional state of the supervisees may have also contributed to the responses and decisions made in the process of the focus group. During the time between the completion of the individual interviews and the focus group, the group experienced the loss of a fellow CIT. The passing of this friend, peer, and fellow counselor impacted the group members on a personal level. While I allowed an extended time period between the interview and focus group, it was inevitable the loss was on the hearts and minds of the CITs. It is not possible to know what impact this might have had on the responses provided.

Another limitation is associated with the unique connection between the group members. Participants in this study worked well together. They had personal connections beyond the group and there were friendships among some of the individuals that extended past the CTC and the

counseling program. This particular group was cohesive and respectful of one another. These connections no doubt contributed to the findings; however, to what extent is largely unknown.

Implications for Practice

Counselors-in-training experience a time of distress in the process of forming their identities as counselors. This is a developmental process explored in the research of counselor education (Skovholt & Ronnestad, 1992; Auxier, et al, 2003). Creative arts can be used in group supervision to help CITs get past rigidity, pressure to be right, and insecurity about being themselves. In this study, CITs experienced a safe environment where they were able to explore concepts in a new way with a group of peers. Counselor educators may be able to use creative arts in supervision groups to foster openness and cohesiveness among CITs as well as assist CITs in getting past rigid perceptions of expectations. In addition, the use of creative arts through the academic training of counselors could assist students and supervisees in moving past rigidity in thoughts and practice, as well as becoming more comfortable being authentic with peer, clients, and supervisors.

In this study, creative arts generated authenticity within the group and a level of self-revelation that seemed unavoidable. The connections and acceptance among the group members was unique to these individuals and may not always be present. Thus, counselor educators and supervisors would do well to be sure that the setting, participants, and instructions for creative arts activities are structured in such a way to provide a safe environment for self-revelation or provide avenues for participants to monitor what they share. Caution should be taken anytime creative art are implemented in group supervision or classroom activities. While this group did not experience any mishandling of sensitive information, sensitive information was shared in the

group' therefore, CITs may experience a sense of vulnerability. However, this is not uncommon in traditional supervision of CITs.

Recommendations for Future Research

Future research is recommended to support and expand the findings of this study. The process related to CITs' experiences in group supervision using creative arts is largely unknown. Future research concerning the process described in these findings would be valuable in adding to the literature about the use of creative arts in group supervision. In addition, further research about elements that produce the sense of safety expressed by participants in this study would also enhance understanding of effective group supervision processes. In specific, the role of the use of creative arts in establishing a sense of safety in group supervision should be further explored. These concepts, in contrast to enjoying the group and gaining awareness of self and client, are not previously explored in current research.

Creative arts in group supervision contributes to the CITs awareness of self and clients. This study attributes that awareness largely to the unique process of doing art intervention in a group setting. Group cohesion paired with the creative intervention together impacted the development of CITs. Future research could examine the differences associated with using creative art in a group setting and in an individual supervision setting. Do supervisees experience the same level of personal and client awareness in an individual supervision experience as those in a group setting?

Finally, future researchers could investigate the unique process of creative arts group supervision in combination with traditional supervision. The participants in this study discussed the balance of the creative arts group with individual traditional supervision and how these

together impacted their development. Do these two supervision practices meet the needs of the supervisee in understanding and intervening with clients? How do these practices together help the supervisee grow as a counselor?

Summary and Conclusion

This study examined the experiences of CITs in group supervision utilizing creative arts interventions. I was interested in how CITs described these experiences and their perceptions of the impact of these methods. More specifically, I was interested in their perceptions of how the creative arts group supervision impacted their case conceptualization and development as counselors. Findings in this study include themes consistent with existing literature as well as themes that have not been discussed in research to this point.

The findings were consistent with current literature in relation to CITs' feelings towards the experience, increased self and client awareness, and using techniques with clients. CITs were able to experience supervision that was enjoyable. They experienced a process that allowed them to look at themselves in a new way, therefore, gaining a new and unique awareness of themselves and their clients. CITs experienced these exercises first hand and were able to add them to their counseling toolboxes. While some supervisees were able to use the exercises with client they were currently working with, others simply stored them with the possibility of using them later in their careers. These concepts are consistent with current research findings. Therefore, this study further grounds them empirically in the literature of counselor education and supervision.

The construct of the safe environment and the detailed description of the unique process experienced with using creative interventions have not previously been empirically grounded in

research. The findings indicate that CITs experience a process that allows them to become mindful and present. CITs enter into this process without being aware and, therefore, present their perceived authentic selves and generate openness with a group of their peers. Also, CITs were able to move past rigid thoughts regarding themselves in the counseling room and their ability to work with clients. These concepts provide an emerging rationale for the impact of creative art on CITs in group supervision.

My hope is that this research inspires further empirical studies about the profound contribution creative arts have on the emerging counselor. While creative arts in the practice of supervision, group supervision and counseling are abundant, these modalities have not reached the same level of presence in research. Grounding these methods in research may be difficult due to the abstract nature of art, however, creative interventions are a part of who we are as counselors and supervisors, counseling is creative.

REFERENCES

- American Art Therapy Association (2013). *The association's mission*. Retrieved from <http://arttherapy.org/aataaboutus.html>
- Amerikaner, M., Schauble, P., & Ziller, R. (1980). Images: The use of photographs in personal counseling. *Personnel & Guidance Journal*, 59(2), 68.
- Amundson, N. E. (1988). The use of metaphor and drawings in case conceptualization. *Journal of Counseling & Development*, 66(8), 391.
- Andrade, H. B. (2009). *A qualitative study of the use of sand for counselor interns in group supervision: A grounded theory approach*. Texas A&M University - Corpus Christi).
- Arts. (n.d.). In Merriam-Webster.com. Retrieved May 31, 2013, from <http://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/arts>
- Atkins, S., & Williams, L. D. (2007). *Sourcebook in expressive arts therapy*. Boone, NC: Parkway Publishers.
- Auxier, C. R., Hughes, F. R., Kline, W. B. (2003). Identity development in counselor-in training. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 43, 25–38.
- Belfiore, E., & Bennett, O. (2007). Determinants of impact: Towards a better understanding of encounters with the arts. *Cultural Trends*, 16(3), 225–275.
- Bernard, J. M. (1979). Supervisor training: A discrimination model. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 19, 60–68.
- Bernard, J. M. (1992). The challenge of psychotherapy-based supervision: Making the pieces fit. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 31(4), 232–238.

- Bernard, J. M. (1997). The discrimination model. In C. E. Watkins, Jr. (Ed.), *Handbook of psychotherapy supervision* (pp. 310–327). New York: Wiley.
- Bernard, J. M., & Goodyear, R. K. (2009). *Fundamentals of clinical supervision* (4th ed.). Upper Saddle River, NJ: Pearson.
- Botkin, D. R. (2000). Family play therapy: A creative approach to including young children in family therapy. *Journal of Systemic Therapies*, 19(3), 31-31. Retrieved from <http://search.proquest.com/docview/222542488?accountid=7084>
- Borda, C. S. (2011). Review of creative family therapy techniques: Play, art, and expressive activities to engage children in family sessions'. *Journal Of Marital And Family Therapy*, 37(2), 267-268. doi:10.1111/j.1752-0606.2011.00225_1.x
- Borders, L. D. (1990). Developmental changes during supervisees' first practicum. *The Clinical Supervisor*, 8(2), 157–167.
- Bratton, S., Ceballos, P., & Sheely, A. (2008). Expressive arts in a humanistic Approach to play therapy supervision: Facilitating therapist self-awareness. In A. A.
- Bratton, R., & Landreth, G. (2008). Play therapy. In M. Herson & A. Gross (Eds.), *Handbook of clinical psychology, Volume II: Children and adolescents*. New York, NY: Wiley.
- Carter, J. W., Enyedy, K., Goodyear, R. K., Arcinue, F., & Puri, N. (2009). Concept mapping of the events supervisees find helpful in group supervision. *Training And Education In Professional Psychology*, 3(1), 1-9. doi:10.1037/a0013656
- Carson, D. K., & Baker, K. W. (2004). When lightning strikes: Reexamining creativity in psychotherapy. *Journal of Counseling & Development*, 82, 111–115.

- Carson, D. K., & Baker, K. W. (2003). *Creativity in mental health practice*. New York, NY: Haworth.
- Carson, D. K. (1999). The importance of creativity in family therapy: A preliminary consideration. *The family journal: Counseling and therapy for couples and families*, 7, 326–334.
- Charmaz, K. (2006). *Constructing grounded theory: A practical guide through qualitative analysis*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Christensen, T. M. & Kline, W. B. (2008). The qualitative exploration of process sensitive peer group supervision. *The Journal for Specialists in Group Work*, 26(1), 81-88.
- Council for the Accreditation of Counseling and Related Educational Programs. (2009). *2009 Standards*. Retrieved from http://www.cacrep.org/2009_standards.html
- Creativity. (n.d.). In Merriam-Webster.com. Retrieved May 31, 2013, from <http://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/creativity>
- Creative. (n.d.). In Merriam-Webster.com. Retrieved May 31, 2013, from <http://www.learnersdictionary.com/search/creative>
- Creswell, J. W. (1998) *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five traditions*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Curry, J. R. (2009). Examining client spiritual history and the construction of meaning: The use of spiritual timelines in counseling. *Journal Of Creativity In Mental Health*, 4(2), 113-123. doi:10.1080/15401380902945178
- Deaver, S. P., & Shiflett, C. (2011). Art-based supervision techniques. *The Clinical Supervisor*, 30(2), 257–276.

- Drewes & J. A. Mullen (Eds.), *Supervision can be playful* (pp. 211–232). Lanham, MD: Jason Aronson.
- Dunbar, K. (2011). *Creativity in triadic supervision: Using mandalas to impact the working alliance* (Doctoral dissertation). Available from ProQuest Dissertations and Theses. (UMI No. 3474240)
- Eckhardt, K. J., & Dinsmore, J. A. (2012). Mindful music listening as a potential treatment for depression. *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health* 7 (2), 175-186.
- Evans, S. (2012). Using computer technology in expressive arts therapy practice: A proposal for increased use. *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health* 7 (1), 49-63.
- Fernando, D. M., & Hulse-Killacky, D. (2005). The relationship of supervisory styles to satisfaction with supervision and the perceived self-efficacy of Master's level counseling students. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 44(4), 293–304. doi:10.1002/j.1556-6978.2005.tb01757.x
- Furr, S. R., & Carroll, J. J. (2003). Critical incidents in student counselor development. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 81, 483–489.
- Ginicola, M. M., Smith, S., & Trzaska, J. (2012). Counseling through images: Using photography to guide the counseling process and achieve treatment goals. *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health* (7)4, 310-329.
- Gladding, S. T. (1998). *Counseling as an art: The creative arts in counseling* (2nd ed.). Alexandria, VA: American Counseling Association.
- Gladding, S. T. (2008). The impact of creativity in counseling. *Journal of creativity in mental health*, 3(2), 97–104.

- Gladding, S. T. (2011). *The creative arts in counseling* (4th ed.). Alexandria, VA: American Counseling Association.
- Gurffrida, D. A., Jordan, R., Saiz, S., & Barns, K. L. (2007). The use of metaphor in clinical supervision. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 85, 393–400.
- Hammond, L. C., & Gantt, L. (1998). Using art in counseling: Ethical considerations. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 76(3) 271–276.
- Howard, E. E., Inman, A. G., & Altman, A. N. (2006). Critical incidents among novice counselor trainees. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 46, 88–102.
- Kindsvatter, A., Granello, D. H., & Duba, J. (2008). Cognitive techniques as a means for facilitating supervisee development. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 47, 179–192.
- Koltz, R. L. (2008). Integrating creativity into supervision using Bernard’s discrimination model. *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health*, 3(4), 416–427. doi:10.1080/15401380802530054
- Kottman, T. (2003). *Partners in play: An Adlerian approach to play therapy* (2nd ed.). Alexandria, VA: American Counseling Association.
- Landreth, G. L. & Bratton, S. C. (2006). *Child parent relationship therapy (CPRT): A 10 session filial therapy model*. New York: Routledge.
- Linton, J. & Hedstorm, S. An exploratory qualitative investigation of group processes in group supervision: Perceptions of masters level practicum students. *Journal for Specialist in Group Work*, 31(1), 51-72
- Loewenthal, D. (2013). Talking pictures therapy as brief therapy in a school setting. *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health* 8 (1), 21-34.

- Luke, M. (2008). Supervision: Models, principals, and process issues. In A. A. Drewes & J. A. Mullen (Eds.), *Supervision can be playful* (pp. 211–232). Lanham, MD: Jason Aronson.
- May, R. (1975). *The courage to create*. New York: Norton & Company
- Malchiodi, C. A. (2007). *The art therapy sourcebook*. New York, NY: McGraw Hill.
- Malchiodi, C. A. (Ed.). (2008). *Creative interventions with traumatized children*. New York, NY: Guilford.
- McNichols, C. D. (2010). *Exploring the use of poetry in counselor training and supervision: A qualitative inquiry* (Doctoral dissertation). Available from ProQuest Dissertations and Theses. (UMI No. 3424442)
- Melton, J. L., Nofzinger-Collins, D., Wynne, M. E., & Susman, M. (2005). Exploring the affective inner experiences of therapist in training: The qualitative interaction between session experience and session content. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 45, 82–96.
- National Coalition of Creative Art Therapies Association. (2013). *NCCATA Fact Sheet*. Retrieved from <http://www.nccata.org/#!/fact-sheet/czsv>
- Neswald-McCalip, R., Sather, J., Strati, J. V., & Dineen, J. (2003). Exploring the process of creative supervision: Initial findings regarding the regenerative model. *Journal of Humanistic Counseling, Education and Development*, 42, 223–237.
- Newsome, D., Henderson, D., & Veach, L. (2005). Using expressive arts in group supervision to enhance awareness and foster cohesion. *Journal of Humanistic Counseling, Education and Development*. 44, 145–157.
- Oaklander, V. (1997). The therapeutic process with children and adolescents. *Gestalt*

- Review*, 1(4), 292–317.
- Oaklander, V. (1978/2007). *Windows to our children*. Gouldsboro, ME: The Gestalt Journal Press.
- O'Brien, E. (2006/2007). From theory to practice: Transferring expressive techniques from supervision to counseling. *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health*, 2(3), 17–27.
doi:10.1300/j456v02n03_03
- Patton, M. Q. (2002). *Qualitative research and evaluation methods* (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Pearson, Q. M. (2006). Psychotherapy-driven supervision: Integrating counseling theories into role-based supervision. *Journal of Mental Health Counseling*, 28(3), 241–252.
- Ray, D. C., Perking, S. R., & Odem, K. (2004). Rosebush fantasy technique with elementary school students. *Education*, 7, 277–282.
- Robert, T., & Kelly, V. A. (2010). Metaphor as an instrument for orchestrating change in counselor training and the counseling process. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 88(2), 182–188.
- Rogers, N. (1993). *The creative connection: Expressive arts as healing*. Palo Alto, CA: Science and Behavior Books.
- Rossi, M. H. (2010). *A phenomenological exploration of the experiences of master's level counselor trainees in expressive arts group supervision* (Doctoral dissertation). Available from ProQuest Dissertations and Theses. (UMI No. 3421834)
- Sassen, G. (2012). Drums and poems: An intervention promoting empathic connection and literacy in children. *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health* 7(3), 233–248.

- Satir, V. (1972). *Peoplemakeing*. Palo Alto: Science and Behavior Books.
- Sawyer, C. B. & Willis, J. M. (2011). Introducing digital storytelling to influence the behavior of children and adolescents. *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health* 6 (4), 274-283.
- Sawyer, R. K., John-Steinder, V., Moran, S., Sternberg, R. J., Feldman, D. H., Nakamura, J., & Csikszentmihalyi, M. (2003). *Creativity and development*. Oxford: Oxford University Press
- Schuck, C., & Wood, J. (2011). *Inspiring creative supervision*. Philadelphia, PA: Jessica Kingsley Publishers.
- Sheflett, C. (2011). A qualitative investigation of the use of an art-based technique in counselor group supervision (Doctoral dissertation). Available from ProQuest Dissertations and Theses. (UMI No. 3492400)
- Skovholt, T. M., & Ronnestad, M. H. (1992). Themes in therapist and counselor development. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 70, 505–515.
- Starling, P. V. & Baker, S. B. (2000). Structured peer group practicum supervision: Supervisees' perceptions of supervision theory. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 39(3), 162-176.
- Waliski, A. (2009). An introduction to expressive and creative techniques for counselors in training. *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health*, 4, 375–385.
doi:10.1080/15401380903372711
- Watkins, C. E. (2010). Psychoanalytic constructs in psychotherapy supervision. *American Journal of Psychotherapy*, 64(4), 393–416.
- Wilkins, P. (1995). A creative therapies model for the group supervision of counsellors. *British Journal of Guidance and Counseling*, 23(2), 245-257

Wilson, B. & Ziomek-Daigle, J. (2013). The use of expressive arts as experienced by high school counselor trainees. *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health*, 8(2), 2-20.

APPENDIX A: IRB APPROVAL LETTER



ERIN L. SHERMAN, MAcc, CRA, CIP
Research Compliance Officer
Division of Research, Commercialization and Outreach

6300 OCEAN DRIVE, UNIT 5844
CORPUS CHRISTI, TEXAS 78412
O 361.825.2497 • F 361.825.2755

June 19, 2012

Ms. Lauren Power
14434 Red River Dr.
Corpus Christi, TX 78410

Dear Ms. Power,

The research project entitled "Creative Arts in Group Supervision of Counselors-in-Training" (IRB# 51-12) has been granted approval through an expedited review under category 7.2.1(9) by the Texas A&M University – Corpus Christi Institutional Review Board (IRB). You are authorized to conduct the project as outlined in the IRB protocol application.

IRB approval is granted for one year from the date approval is granted. You must submit an IRB Continuing Review Application for IRB committee review and approval should the project continue beyond June 19, 2013. Please submit the IRB Continuing Review Application at least one month prior to the approval expiration date to allow time for IRB review.

Please submit an IRB Amendment Application for ANY modifications to the approved study protocol. Changes to the study may not be initiated before the amendment is approved. Please submit an IRB Completion Report to the Compliance Office upon the conclusion of the project. Both report formats can be downloaded from IRB website.

All study records must be maintained by the researcher for three years after the completion of the study. Please contact me if you will no longer be affiliated with Texas A&M University – Corpus Christi before the conclusion of the records retention timeframe to discuss retention requirements.

We wish you the best on the project. Please contact me with any questions.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Erin L. Sherman".

Erin L. Sherman

APPENDIX B: CONSENT FORM

CONSENT FORM

Creative Arts in Group Supervision of Counselors-in-training

Introduction

The purpose of this form is to provide you information that may affect your decision as to whether or not to participate in this research study. If you decide to participate in this study, this form will also be used to record your consent.

You have been asked to participate in a research project studying the use of creative arts in group supervision with counselors-in-training. The purpose of this study is to examine how counselors-in-training perceive the use of creative arts methods in group supervision and how they describe its perceived effects. You were selected to be a possible participant because you are currently working at the Counseling and Training Clinic and are completing practicum or internship.

What will I be asked to do?

If you agree to participate in this study, you will be asked to attend weekly group supervision during the fall semester that infuses different creative arts exercises such as drawing, sculpture, and sand tray. At the end of each supervision session you will be asked to journal to reflect on your perceptions of the process.

The researcher may also ask for permission to photograph any product (paintings, drawings, etc.) after supervision sessions that generated such materials. The researcher will only photograph materials that will not reveal your identity.

Upon completion of the supervision sessions you will be asked to participate in an individual interview and a focus group where you and other participants will talk about your overall experiences. Each group supervision session will last approximately one hour and take place each week. This study will be during the fall semester, beginning the second week of classes and be complete the week prior to finals.

Your participation in individual interviews and focus groups will be audio recorded.

What are the risks involved in this study?

The risks associated with this study are minimal, and are no more than traditional risks associated with counseling group supervision.

What are the possible benefits of this study?

The possible benefits of participation include giving voice to students who participate in this modality of supervision. Having a voice in the professional literature may be empowering to participants. This study may bridge a gap in the literature by providing to the field an in-depth description of the experiences of counselors-in-training who receive such supervision, both in terms of their perceptions of its impact on their development as counselors and of its impact on their conceptualizations about clients. Participant will also benefit from the proposed study by having the opportunity to participate in qualitative research, therefore gaining an understanding of what qualitative research is like as well as de-mystify the process. Finally, participants will receive additional supervision as part of

their field placement at the Counseling and Training Clinic, which may enhance their skills and confidence and may enhance services provided to clients.

Do I have to participate?

No. Your participation is voluntary. You may decide not to participate or to withdraw at any time without your current or future relations with Texas A&M University-Corpus Christi and the Counseling and Training Clinic being affected.

Who will know about my participation in this research study?

This study is confidential and all records of this study will be kept in a secure location. The records of this study will be kept private. No identifiers linking you to this study will be included in any sort of report that might be published. Research records will be stored securely and only Lauren Power and Dr. Marvarene Oliver will have access to the records. If you choose to participate in this study, you will be audio recorded during individual interviews and focus group. Any audio recordings will be stored securely and Lauren Power and Dr. Marvarene Oliver will have access to the recordings. Any recordings will be kept for transcription purposed and then erased.

Whom do I contact with questions about the research?

If you have questions regarding this study, you may contact Lauren Power, M.S., LPC-Intern, 361-850-3289, lauren_shows@yahoo.com or Marvarene Oliver, Ed.D., LPC-S, LMFT-S, 361-825-2622, marvarene.oliver@tamucc.edu

Whom do I contact about my rights as a research participant?

This research study has been reviewed by the Research Compliance Office and/or the Institutional Review Board at Texas A&M University-Corpus Christi. For research-related problems or questions regarding your rights as a research participant, you can contact Erin Sherman, Research Compliance Officer, at (361) 825-2497 or erin.sherman@tamucc.edu

Signature

Please be sure you have read the above information, asked questions and received answers to your satisfaction. You will be given a copy of the consent form for your records. By signing this document, you consent to participate in this study. You also certify that you are 18 years of age or older by signing this form.

_____ I agree to be audio recorded.

_____ I do not want to be audio recorded.

Signature of Participant: _____ **Date:** _____

Printed Name: _____

Signature of Person Obtaining Consent: _____ **Date:** _____

Printed Name: _____

APPENDIX C: IRB AMENDMENT APPROVAL FOR PEER REVIEWER



ERIN L. SHERMAN, MAcc, CRA, CIP, CPIA
Research Compliance Officer
Division of Research, Commercialization and Outreach

6300 OCEAN DRIVE, UNIT 5844
CORPUS CHRISTI, TEXAS 78412
O 361.825.2497 • F 361.825.2755

Human Subjects Protection Program**Institutional Review Board**

APPROVAL DATE: April 16, 2013
TO: Ms. Lauren Power
CC: Dr. Marvarene Oliver
FROM: Office of Research Compliance
Institutional Review Board
SUBJECT: Amendment Approval

Protocol Number: 51-12
Amendment #: 1
Title: Creative Arts in Group Supervision of Counselors-in-Training
Review Category: Expedited
Expiration Date: June 19, 2013

Approval determination was based on the following Code of Federal Regulations:

Eligible for Expedited Approval (45 CFR 46.110): Identification of the subjects or their responses (or the remaining procedures involving identification of subjects or their responses) will NOT reasonably place them at risk of criminal or civil liability or be damaging to the their financial standing, employability, insurability, reputation, or be stigmatizing, unless reasonable and appropriate protections will be implemented so that risks related to invasion of privacy and breach of confidentiality are no greater than minimal.

Criteria for Approval has been met (45 CFR 46.111)

The criteria for approval listed in 45 CFR 46.111 have been met (or if previously met, have not changed).

(7) Research on individual or group characteristics or behavior (including, but not limited to, research on perception, cognition, motivation, identity, language, communication, cultural beliefs or practices, and social behavior) or research employing survey, interview, oral history, focus group, program evaluation, human factors evaluation, or quality assurance methodologies. (NOTE: Some research in this category may be exempt from the HHS regulations for the protection of human subjects. 45 CFR 46.101(b)(2) and (b)(3). This listing refers only to research that is not exempt.)

Approved Amendments:

Provisions:

Comments:

This research project has been approved. As principal investigator, you assume the following responsibilities:

1. Informed Consent: Information must be presented to enable persons to voluntarily decide whether or not to participate in the research project unless otherwise waived.
2. Amendments: Changes to the protocol must be requested by submitting an Amendment Application to the Research Compliance Office for review. The Amendment must be approved by the IRB before being

implemented.

3. Continuing Review: The protocol must be renewed each year in order to continue with the research project. A Continuing Review Application, along with required documents must be submitted 45 days before the end of the approval period, to the Research Compliance Office. Failure to do so may result in processing delays and/or non-renewal.
4. Completion Report: Upon completion of the research project (including data analysis and final written papers), a Completion Report must be submitted to the Research Compliance Office.
5. Records Retention: Records must be retained for three years beyond the completion date of the study.
6. Adverse Events: Adverse events must be reported to the Research Compliance Office immediately

APPENDIX D: DEMOGRPAHIC FORM

Demographic Form

Gender

- ☐ Male
- ☐ Female

Age: _____

Race/Ethnicity: _____

Level of Clinical Practice

- ☐ Practicum
- ☐ Internship 1
- ☐ Internship 2

Clinical Focus

- ☐ Addictions
- ☐ Clinical Mental Health
- ☐ Marriage and Family

Undergraduate Degree: _____ Year completed: _____

Other Degrees Obtained: _____ Year completed: _____

APPENDIX E: JOURNAL PROMPTS

Journal Prompts

- 1) My experience of today's creative arts group supervision
- 2) What I took away from today's creative arts group supervision about my client(s)
- 3) How I see the impact of today's group supervision on me as a counselor

APPENDIX F: CREATIVE ARTS ACTIVITIES

Creative Arts Activities

Parameters for each group supervision session were set the first week and reinforced each week after. This was done to aid in the psychological safety of the environment and protect the CITs. CITs were asked to:

1. Share what they created; however, disclosure was not mandatory.
2. Be respectful of what individual sharing.
3. Provide feedback to group members; however, feedback not mandatory.
4. Provide feedback only within the context of what the CIT shared.
5. Refrain from judgment and definitive statements.

Each activity was thoughtfully chosen and ordered due to the professional literature on creative arts in counseling and supervision as well as my experience with each set of materials. All activities were approximately 60 minutes. Upon completion of each group exercise participants responded to journal prompts.

Week One: Introductions through Personal Roadmap or Timeline

Materials- Butcher paper and colored pencils

CITs were asked to create a roadmap or timeline using colored pencils. The timeline or roadmap was to describe how got to their current position in their education/career or the process in choosing this particular path in life. As the supervisor, I encouraged the group on only create on the time line what they were willing to share with the group. The CIT were given time to work individually and were asked to remain quiet if they finished prior to other members of the group. Once every one was finished each CIT was invited to share their work, however there was no obligation to do so. This activity was chosen to be the introductory activity for several

reasons. The timeline or roadmap was chosen to allow the individual CIT to introduce themselves to the group in a non-threatening way. It is likely that each member of the group had done a similar activity previously in school at some time. The materials, colored pencil and white paper, used in this activity were chosen to be simple and controllable; therefore, it could be considered a non-threatening activity.

Sample of art data-



Week Two: Exploring Concepts through Photographs and Images

Materials- Supervisee selected photographs and images (found or personal)

CIT were asked to bring in meaningful photos to group supervision. They were asked to bring in three to six photos, one or two personally meaningful, one or two representing “healing”, and one or two representing “counselor”. This activity was to explore visual representations of each of these things: personal connection, healing, and counselor. CITs

brought in various photos and group discussion centered on the sharing of these images. CITs were asked to introduce the images and discuss their rational with choosing the particular image.

Sample of art data:



Week Three: Rosebush Fantasy Technique

Materials- Construction paper, colored pencils, and chalk

The Rosebush Fantasy Technique (Oaklander, 2007; Ray et al., 2004), using chalk and colored pencils, was presented to CITs. This activity began with a visualization of a rosebush that is representative of the participant. The CITs explored aspects of the rosebush such as location, physical characteristics, support, and other objects or life around it. Once the visualization was done the CITs used the chalk and colored pencils to create the rosebush they visualized on paper. Ample time was given for the CITs to complete the image and, as with

previous exercises, the CITs were instructed to remain quiet and respectful of those CITs still working. Once CITs was finished they were each invited to share their work with the group.

Sample of art data:



Week Four: Creature Creation

Materials- Model Magic (putty type material found at craft store), feathers, stones, pipe cleaners, fabric, and miniature figures

This week, the CITs created a creature using model magic designed to assess supervisees' needs (Bratton, Ceballos, & Sheely, 2008). The activity began with a visualization of themselves in a time when there are no humans. During the visualization they were asked to think of what kind of creature they would be. Once the visualization was complete they were to create the creature using the provided materials. As with other activates, they were asked to work quietly and remain respectful of those around them. Once everyone was finished, I asked the CITs a series of questions concerning the creatures various strengths, challenges, survival skills, needs

and barriers to obtaining needs. Specific questions can be found in Bratton, Ceballos, & Sheely (2008). After the series of questions and CITs' responses, I invited the group to share what they created. Each CIT took turns describing the creature created. Group members reflected, made observations, and asked questions about the creations. This activity was adapted from Bratton, Ceballos, & Sheely (2008).

Sample of art data:



Week Five: Sand Tray

Materials: Wooden sand tray and various miniatures

A sand tray activity was done in the group. Sand tray was used to facilitate symbolic thinking and awareness of CIT interpersonal counseling style (Andrade, 2009). CITs were invited to share a client concern using the sand tray. A single sand tray and miniatures were available for the students to use at the CTC. Three students were able to present cases while the remaining observed and asked questions. I presented the activity and asked for volunteers to

process a particular concern with a client. Volunteering CITs were asked to examine the miniatures and select ones that they viewed as representative of the concern they wanted to explore. They were then asked to place the miniatures in the sand as a way to communicate the concern. Once this step was complete, I described the process of choosing and placing the miniatures that I observed and asked the volunteering CITs to explain what they created. Upon explanation discussion of sand scene and concern was opened up to observing CITs.

Sample of art data:



Week Six: Painting an Emotion

Materials: 12x12 canvas, acrylic paint (white, black, red, yellow, and blue), paintbrushes (various sizes), sponges, trash bags (cut for use as table cloth and participant aprons), cups, water, plates (for mixing paint), and easels

CITs were instructed to paint a client's emotion. CIT's were asked to explore an emotion presented by a client that they had difficulty understanding. They were encouraged to explore an

emotion that was possibly difficult to put into words. They were given a brief explanation to creating more colors using the five provided. Instructions were given and CITs were allowed to work. Soft music was provided to foster the creative connection (Rogers, 1993). Once CITs were finished, they presented their paintings to the group one by one. Each CIT gave their painting a name, and discussed the client and emotion explored in the painting. Group members made observations and provided feedback.

Sample of art data:



Week Seven: Music to Relate

Materials: Computer and participant-provided music

Each group member was asked to bring in two pieces of music: one that represented their “self” as a counselor and one that represented a client or client concern. CITs were asked to provide a brief introduction and rationale for the music selection, and then share their music with

the group. A computer was utilized to look up and play music as needed; however, some CITs brought in iPods and CDs. After each CIT shared their music, the group provided feedback and discussion was generated.

Sample of art data:

Bobby Marchan “There’s Something on your Mind”

The Chantels “If You Try”

Colby Calie “Begin Again”

The Lumineers “Stubborn Love”

Shine Down “Second Chance”

Perfect Circle “Weak and Powerless”

Week Eight: Constructing a Concern through Clay

Materials- Modeling clay, various clay modeling tools, and trash bags (cut for use as table cloth)

CITs were asked to use clay to represent their self in the process of developing as a counselor, a particular client, or a client’s concern. CITs were given time to work with the clay and construct their figures. Once each member of the group was finished, each shared their work with the group. Group members presented what they created to the group and feedback was provided. Once this process was complete the group created an image with the clay together that represented the group. They discussed the figure.

Sample of art data:



Week Nine: Found Poem

Materials- Paper and pencil/pen

CITs created found poems (McNichols, 2010). With this activity CITs were instructed to free write about an issue they would bring into supervision. Once this task was complete, they were asked to go back, read what they wrote, and change or add anything they felt should be different. Next they were asked to read through what they wrote a second time and highlight any words or phrases that stood out to them or were particularly meaningful. Upon completion of this step they were asked to transfer what was highlighted to a second page, creating the found poem. They were able to make adjustments in their writing as necessary to create the final product. CITs shared their found poems with the group. The group members provided feedback and processed what was created.

Sample of art data:

Freely decide my various shenanigans
Are my attempts to answer the question

I don't want to

Grow
Become
Get
Be

I would say hip hip hooray!!
[two exclamation marks]
Probably as near as you get to affection

Unscathed
Better
Wiser
Stronger for the wear

Don't know what I'm doing here
And just being able to tell someone that,
And know you can tell them that,
And not risk any reprisals,
Makes all the difference

So, thanks

Week Ten: Collage to Explore Concepts

Materials- Magazines (purposely selected and appropriate for this activity), scissors, glue, and construction paper

CITs were instructed to create a collage using materials provided. CITs were responsible for selecting and manipulating images from the magazines. They were asked to create a collage that represented a client, a client concern, or himself or herself as a counselor. CITs were engaged in discussion concerning the overall group experience and what they were currently working on throughout the activity. Once complete, CITs shared what they created and discussed the process. Time at the end of this group was utilized to discuss the completion of the ten-week group supervision experience. This was to provide closure to the group.

Sample of art data:



APPENDIX G: INDIVIDUAL INTERVIEW QUESTIONS

Individual Interview Questions

- 1) What was your overall experience of participating in a supervision group using creative arts methods?
- 2) In what ways did using creative arts in supervision impact you personally?
- 3) In what ways did using creative arts in supervision affect how you conceptualize your cases?
- 4) What is your perception of ways in which participating in group supervision using creative arts methods may have impacted your development as a counselor?
- 5) What other thoughts or reactions do you have about this method of providing group supervision?

APPENDIX H: IRB AMENDMENT APPROVAL 2



ERIN L. SHERMAN, MAcc, CRA, CIP, CPIA
Research Compliance Officer
Division of Research, Commercialization and Outreach

6300 OCEAN DRIVE, UNIT 5844
CORPUS CHRISTI, TEXAS 78412
O 361.825.2497 • F 361.825.2755

Human Subjects Protection Program

Institutional Review Board

APPROVAL DATE: June 4, 2013
TO: Ms. Lauren Power
CC: Dr. Marvarene Oliver
FROM: Office of Research Compliance
Institutional Review Board
SUBJECT: Amendment Approval

Protocol Number: 51-12
Amendment #: 2
Title: Creative Arts in Group Supervision of Counselors-in-Training
Review Category: Expedited
Expiration Date: June 19, 2013

Approval determination was based on the following Code of Federal Regulations:

Eligible for Expedited Approval (45 CFR 46.110): Identification of the subjects or their responses (or the remaining procedures involving identification of subjects or their responses) will NOT reasonably place them at risk of criminal or civil liability or be damaging to the their financial standing, employability, insurability, reputation, or be stigmatizing, unless reasonable and appropriate protections will be implemented so that risks related to invasion of privacy and breach of confidentiality are no greater than minimal.

Criteria for Approval has been met (45 CFR 46.111)

The criteria for approval listed in 45 CFR 46.111 have been met (or if previously met, have not changed).

(7) Research on individual or group characteristics or behavior (including, but not limited to, research on perception, cognition, motivation, identity, language, communication, cultural beliefs or practices, and social behavior) or research employing survey, interview, oral history, focus group, program evaluation, human factors evaluation, or quality assurance methodologies. (NOTE: Some research in this category may be exempt from the HHS regulations for the protection of human subjects. 45 CFR 46.101(b)(2) and (b)(3). This listing refers only to research that is not exempt.)

Approved Amendments: Revision of procedures & consent form to allow use of photos of participant artwork

Provisions:

Comments:

This research project has been approved. As principal investigator, you assume the following responsibilities:

1. Informed Consent: Information must be presented to enable persons to voluntarily decide whether or not to participate in the research project unless otherwise waived.
2. Amendments: Changes to the protocol must be requested by submitting an Amendment Application to the Research Compliance Office for review. The Amendment must be approved by the IRB before being implemented.

3. Continuing Review: The protocol must be renewed each year in order to continue with the research project. A Continuing Review Application, along with required documents must be submitted 45 days before the end of the approval period, to the Research Compliance Office. Failure to do so may result in processing delays and/or non-renewal.
4. Completion Report: Upon completion of the research project (including data analysis and final written papers), a Completion Report must be submitted to the Research Compliance Office.
5. Records Retention: Records must be retained for three years beyond the completion date of the study.
6. Adverse Events: Adverse events must be reported to the Research Compliance Office immediately

APPENDIX I: AMENDED CONSENT FORM

CONSENT FORM

Creative Arts in Group Supervision of Counselors-in-training

Introduction

The purpose of this form is to provide you information that may affect your decision as to whether or not to participate in this research study. If you decide to participate in this study, this form will also be used to record your consent.

You have been asked to participate in a research project studying the use of creative arts in group supervision with counselors-in-training. The purpose of this study is to examine how counselors-in-training perceive the use of creative arts methods in group supervision and how they describe its perceived effects. You were selected to be a possible participant because you are currently working at the Counseling and Training Clinic and are completing practicum or internship.

What will I be asked to do?

If you agree to participate in this study, you will be asked to attend weekly group supervision during the fall semester that infuses difference creative arts exercises such as drawing, sculpture, and sand tray. At the end of each supervision session you will be asked to journal to reflect on your perceptions of the process.

The researcher may also ask for permission to photograph any product (paintings, drawings, etc.) after supervision sessions that generated such materials. The researcher will only photograph materials that will not reveal your identity.

Upon completion of the supervision sessions you will be asked to participate in an individual interview and a focus group where you and other participants will talk about your overall experiences. Each group supervision session will last approximately one hour and take place each week. This study will be during the fall semester, beginning the second week of classes and be complete the week prior to finals.

Your participation in individual interviews and focus groups will be audio recorded.

What are the risks involved in this study?

The risks associated with this study are minimal, and are no more than traditional risks associated with counseling group supervision.

What are the possible benefits of this study?

The possible benefits of participation include giving voice to students who participate in this modality of supervision. Having a voice in the professional literature may be empowering to participants. This study may bridge a gap in the literature by providing to the field an in-depth description of the experiences of counselors-in-training who receive such supervision, both in terms of their perceptions of its impact on their development as counselors and of its impact on their conceptualizations about clients. Participant will also benefit from the proposed study by having the opportunity to participate in qualitative research, therefore gaining an understanding of what qualitative research is like as well as de-mystify the process. Finally, participants will

receive additional supervision as part of their field placement at the Counseling and Training Clinic, which may enhance their skills and confidence and may enhance services provided to clients.

Do I have to participate?

No. Your participation is voluntary. You may decide not to participate or to withdraw at any time without your current or future relations with Texas A&M University-Corpus Christi and the Counseling and Training Clinic being affected.

Who will know about my participation in this research study?

This study is confidential and all records of this study will be kept in a secure location. The records of this study will be kept private. No identifiers linking you to this study will be included in any sort of report that might be published. Research records will be stored securely and only Lauren Power and Dr. Marvarene Oliver will have access to the records.

If you choose to participate in this study, you will be audio recorded during individual interviews and focus group. Any audio recordings will be stored securely and Lauren Power and Dr. Marvarene Oliver will have access to the recordings. Any recordings will be kept for transcription purposed and then erased.

Whom do I contact with questions about the research?

If you have questions regarding this study, you may contact Lauren Power, M.S., LPC-Intern, 361-850-3289, lauren_shows@yahoo.com or Marvarene Oliver, Ed.D., LPC-S, LMFT-S, 361-825-2622, marvarene.oliver@tamucc.edu

Whom do I contact about my rights as a research participant?

This research study has been reviewed by the Research Compliance Office and/or the Institutional Review Board at Texas A&M University-Corpus Christi. For research-related problems or questions regarding your rights as a research participant, you can contact Erin Sherman, Research Compliance Officer, at (361) 825-2497 or erin.sherman@tamucc.edu

Signature

Please be sure you have read the above information, asked questions and received answers to your satisfaction. You will be given a copy of the consent form for your records. By signing this document, you consent to participate in this study. You also certify that you are 18 years of age or older by signing this form.

Please select one option below.

- ☐ I agree to be audio recorded.
- ☐ I do not want to be audio recorded.

Please select one option below.

- ☐ I allow the researcher to publish the products (photographed or typed) I created during the creative arts group supervision.
- ☐ I do not allow the researcher to publish the products (photographed or typed) I created during the creative arts group supervision.

Signature of Participant:

Typed Name:

Date:

Signature of Person Obtaining Consent:

Typed Name:

Date: